Indicators of Health Care in the *System of National Accounts*

Task Force on the SNA Research Agenda Task Team on Well-Being and Sustainability Area Group on Health and Social Conditions*

January 2022

^{*} Contributions to this Guidance Note were made by members of the area group on health and social conditions. Members include Ann Lisbet Brathaug (Statistics Norway – chair of the group from July 2021), Elisabeth Hopkins (Statistics Sweden), Ciara O'Shea (Central Statistics Office Ireland), Paolo Passerini (Eurostat), Maria Pettersson (Statistics Sweden), Dylan Rassier (U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis – chair of the group until July 2021), Lisbeth Rivas (International Monetary Fund), and Rachel Soloveichik (U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis).

Contents

Summary	2
1. Introduction	2
2. The System of Health Accounts 2011 (Existing Material)	3
2.1. Background	3
2.2. Scope and Framework	4
2.2.1. Classification of Health Care Functions	4
2.2.2. Classification of Health Care Providers	5
2.2.3. Classification of Health Care Financing Schemes	5
2.3. Comparing the SHA and the SNA	6
3 Conceptual Issues and Coverage of the Accounts	7
3.1 Paid Long-Term Social Care Services	7
3.2 Unpaid Household Care Services	7
3.3 Measuring Volumes of Health Services	8
4 Recommendations	8
4.1 Proposed Changes to the Central Framework of the SNA 2008 (Core)	8
4.2 Proposals for Extended or Supplementary Tables (Non-Core)	9
4.3 Proposed Changes to the SHA 2011	11
5 Questions for Consultation	12
References	13
Annex A: Tables	14
Table 1: Health Care Product Classification in the SHA	15
Table 2: Classification of Health Care Functions in the SHA at First-Digit Level	17
Table 3: Classification of Health Care Providers in the SHA at First-Digit Level	17
Table 4: Classification of Health Care Financing Schemes in the SHA at First-Digit Level	17
Table 5: Correspondence between ICHA-HC and CPC Ver. 2	18
Table 6: Correspondence between ICHA-HP and ISIC Rev. 4	19
Table 7: Relation of Consumption to SNA and SHA Aggregates	20
Table 8: Own-Use Production Work of Service Activities and Market Counterparts	20
Table 9: Questions to Identify Households Providing Health Care or Social Care	21
Table 10: Indicators Based on Final Consumption Expenditures and Capital Formation	22
Table 11 Health output, by provider and health functions. Current prices	23
Table 12 Health expenditure, by consumer and health function. Current prices	24
Table 13 Financing, by sector and health function. Current prices	25

Summary

The objective of this Guidance Note is to present proposals for indicators of health care in the *System of National Accounts (SNA)*. The *System of Health Accounts 2011 (SHA 2011)* provides the foundation for the proposals. The *SHA 2011* is a well-developed framework for classifying health expenditures by function, provider and financing schemes.

It is proposed to base the indicators on data already developed in the *SHA 2011*, a framework more than 40 countries are following and with reporting to international organizations. The indicators are considered appropriate for extended or supplementary tables. Only one of the proposals in this Guidance Note is relevant for the central framework of the *SNA* (core accounts).

Options to be developed in extended or supplementary tables include:

- additional indicators that will help inform policy on health care, social care and well-being;
- extensions to the SNA production boundary to include unpaid household provision of health care and long-term social care;
- creation of extended supply and use tables for health care and long-term social care to help ensure consistency and completeness of the analysis of health care and social care; and
- inclusion in the *SNA*, for use in the extended accounts, the *SHA 2011* classifications for health care functions and providers.

Recommendation for improvements in the SNA central framework:

• improving estimates of health services in constant prices by compiling health expenditure in volume terms with improved methods to capture changes in quality of care.

It is also recommended to harmonize *SHA* and *SNA* to the extent possible. Even though the differences between *SHA 2011* and *SNA* in practice are marginal, it should be a goal that the *SNA* concepts and definitions are fully embedded in the *SHA* framework.

1. Introduction

- 1. A well-rounded picture of a country's economy should include data that enables policymakers and other users of official statistics to assess resources spent on health care and to estimate real output of health care. This is already addressed in the joint OECD, Eurostat and World Health Organization (WHO) framework *A System of Health Accounts 2011 (SHA 2011)*. The *SHA* was established in 2000 and revised in 2011. By 2019, 44 countries reported data to OECD according to the system. For EU countries including European Economic Area (EEA) (Norway and Iceland), the joint reporting to OECD, WHO and Eurostat is regulated by law (*Regulation (EC) No 1338/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council also covering statistics on health care expenditure and financing*).
- 2. The *SNA* is the primary economic statistical framework that supports policymaking. As measures of well-being become more important to decision making, the relevance of macroeconomic statistics depends on the ability to adapt the *SNA* and develop a more comprehensive framework to meet the evolving needs of policymakers and other users.

- 3. The objective of this Guidance Note is to present proposals for indicators of health care in the national accounts. In this context, it would be beneficial to build on the well-developed framework in *SHA 2011* for classifying health expenditures by function, provider, and financing schemes. This proposal provides extensions of the central framework to expand official measures of well-being. We propose to use the *SHA 2011* as the foundation for achieving the objective including analyses of who benefit from the resources spent on health and social care (distributional analysis).
- 4. This Guidance Note looks at a number of questions and puts forward proposed options for the update of the current *SNA*:
 - What is the *SHA 2011*, is it consistent with the *SNA* and could it be used to improve analyses of health, social care and well-being in the *SNA*? (Section 2).
 - To what extent should national accounts include long-term social care services in a broader measure of well-being? (Section 3)
 - Should national accounts boundaries be extended to include unpaid household production of health and long-term social care, or should unpaid household production at least be measured given its implications for government policy to promote well-being? (Section 3)
 - Should own-account production of health care services (occupational health care) be imputed? (Section 3)
 - How should volumes of health care services be measured in light of quality differences?
 (Section 3)
 - What are the proposals for improving the current *SNA* and do these involve changes to the central framework of the *SNA* or extensions of the central framework? (Section 4)

2. The System of Health Accounts 2011 (Existing Material)

2.1. Background

- 5. A System of Health Accounts 2011 (SHA 2011) is a result of a joint cooperation among the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), World Health Organization (WHO), and Eurostat, and it builds on the first edition of A System of Health Accounts (OECD 2000), the Guide to Producing National Health Accounts (WHO, World Bank, and USAID 2003), and the SHA Guidelines (Eurostat and UK Office for National Statistics 2003). The first edition of the SHA is described in paragraphs 29.128-29.142 of 2008 SNA. The SHA methodology was revised in 2011.
- 6. The background for setting up the health accounts is described in SHA 2011 as follows:
 - "Health accounts provide a systematic description of the financial flows related to the consumption of health care goods and services. Their intent is to describe a health system from an expenditure perspective. But as more countries implement and institutionalize health accounts, there are increased expectations from analysts, policy makers, and the general public alike for the more sophisticated information that can be gained through the greater volume of health expenditure data now available. Health accounts are increasingly expected to provide inputs (along with other statistical

information) into improved analytical tools to monitor and assess health system performance." (SHA 2011, p. 20)

- 7. The *SHA* is organized around a tri-axial system, defining consumption of health care goods and services by function, provision of health care services by industry, and financing of health care (i.e., sources of funding). The three dimensions have their own classifications. Consumption of goods and services classified according to health care functions is the starting point and defines the boundaries of the health accounts. What is consumed must be provided, meaning that setting up the system within a supply and use framework would be a useful tool for ensuring consistency and completeness. Finally, what is produced and consumed must be financed. Therefore, there is a clear link and consistency among the three axes.
- 8. The *SHA* is closely linked to compilations in the national accounts as well as business accounting and public accounting standards.
- 9. SHA 2011 provides a standard for classifying health expenditures and the underlying objectives include 1) providing a framework relevant for international comparisons of health expenditure and health system analysis, 2) providing a tool that can produce useful data to monitor and analyze the health system, and 3) defining internationally harmonized boundaries for tracking expenditures on health care consumption (SHA 2011, p. 25).

2.2. Scope and Framework

- 10. The three key classifications in the *SHA* are 1) classification of health care functions (HC), 2) classification of health care providers (HP), and 3) classification of health care financing schemes (HF). These three classifications answer the questions what types of health care services are provided, who provides the services, and how are they financed? Other classifications are also provided in the system, but the three outlined above are essential and closely related to reporting of data. They provide the tools to account comprehensively for health care financing, and they define the key concepts and the relationships among consumption (function), production (provider), and financing.
- 11. An example of other classifications provided in the SHA framework is the classification of health care goods and services, described in Annex E of SHA 2011. The primary use of the product classification is to facilitate the boundary-setting and recommend what products should be selected when estimating health care expenditures. The product classification in the SHA is linked to the SNA Central Product Classification (CPC) and the Classification of Products by Activity (CPA) of the European System of Accounts (ESA) (see Table 1 in the annex of this note), and thus the supply and use framework in the national accounts. Although this Guidance Note does not recommend changes to the product classifications in the SNA update, it does recommend a review of the SHA product classifications to move towards greater consistency with the SNA (see Section 4.3).

2.2.1. Classification of Health Care Functions

12. Health care functions relate to "what is the purpose" or "the type of need a transaction or group of transactions aims to satisfy" (*SHA 2011*, p. 72). This is the most fundamental classification within the *SHA* and defines what is in and out of scope for "health care".

- 13. The first-digit level of this classification aims to identify the type of need of the consumer—curative care, rehabilitative care, etc. <u>Table 2</u> in the annex of this note presents the first-digit level from table 5.1 of *SHA 2011*. The classification is broken down into further detail, as the two-digit level of curative care can be distributed among inpatient curative care (HC.1.1), day curative care (HC.1.2), outpatient curative care (HC.1.3), and home-based curative care (HC.1.4). The three-digit level is further split in table 5.1 of the *SHA 2011*.
- 14. There will always be borderline cases between health care and social care. Long-term care (health) consists of a range of medical and personal care services that are consumed, and the goal is to alleviate pain and suffering and reduce deterioration in the health status of patients depending on long-term care. The *SHA* describes what to include under this function, but the handbook also recommends to measure, as a memorandum item (not part of health expenditures), the expenditures related to long-term care (social). What is defined as long-term care (social) is listed in the handbook (*SHA 2011*, p. 114) and includes subsidies to residential services (as well as expenditure on accommodation) in assisted living arrangements and other kinds of protection housings for persons with functional limitations etc., housekeeping services, day-care social services for dependent persons, and transport to and from day-care facilities or similar social services for persons with functional limitations. The definition is important in order to maintain a consistent definition of 'health care' across countries and over time.
- 15. SHA 2011 Annex A gives a detailed correspondence between the functional classification (HC) and the CPC product classification and between the HC and classifications in the SNA: classification of individual consumption according to purpose (COICOP), classification of the functions of government (COFOG), and classification of the purposes of non-profit institutions serving households (COPNI). Details of the correspondence between the health care functions and COFOG, COICOP and COPNI can be found in table A.1.5 in the SHA 2011.

2.2.2. Classification of Health Care Providers

- 16. Health care providers include organizations and actors that deliver health care goods and services as their primary activity, as well as those for which provision of health care products is a secondary activity (*SHA 2011*, p. 122).² <u>Table 3</u> in the annex of this note adapts the first-digit level from table 6.2 of *SHA 2011*. The provider's classification is broken down into two- and three-digit levels. For example, hospitals (HP.1) can be split into general hospitals (HP.1.1), mental health hospitals (HP.1.2), and specialized hospitals other than mental health hospitals (HP.1.3).
- 17. SHA 2011 Annex A gives a detailed correspondence between the provider classification (HP) and the International Standard Industrial Classification (ISIC) and between the provider classification (HP) and institutional sectors in the SNA. Table 6 in the annex shows the correspondence between HP and ISIC, while table A.1.12 in SHA 2011 gives the correspondence between the HP-classification and institutional sectors in SNA.

2.2.3. Classification of Health Care Financing Schemes

18. This classification reveals who is financing the expenditures. The financing schemes will include both direct payments by households and third-party financing arrangements. <u>Table 4</u> in the

² All other industries as secondary providers of health care are classified under HP.8.2. Health and Social Conditions – December 2021

annex of this note reports the first-digit level from table 7.3 of *SHA 2011*. The financing classification is broken down into two- and three-digit levels. For example, government schemes and compulsory health care financing schemes (HF.1) can be broken down into government schemes (HF.1.1), compulsory contributory health insurance schemes (HF.1.2), and compulsory medical savings accounts (HF.1.3).

19. *SHA 2011 Annex A* gives a detailed correspondence between financing schemes and institutional sectors in the *SNA*.

2.3. Comparing the SHA and the SNA

- 20. As already indicated, there is a link between the *SHA* and the *SNA*, and *SHA* 2011 describes how health expenditures and financing data reported in the *SHA* cross-classified tables relate to the main macroeconomic variables in the *SNA*. Hence, data for the *SHA* can be retrieved from national accounts if the basic detail information is included. The *SHA* also gives guidelines for compilation of additional *SNA*-type accounts. The links between the *SHA* and the *SNA* are provided in *Annex B* of *SHA* 2011.
- 21. Current health expenditures reported in the *SHA* are equal to the sum of health care goods and services for final consumption of resident units. When broken down by providers (i.e. HC x HP), this represents the value of the part of output from health care providers that is consumed by households, NPISH, and government. The "final consumption expenditure" in the *SHA* also includes the service of "occupational health" (e.g. surveillance of employee health and therapeutic care on or off business premises) which are considered as an ancillary activity in the central framework of the *SNA* and treated as intermediate consumption.
- 22. Another difference between the *SHA* and the *SNA*, set out in *Annex B* of *SHA 2011*, is that the *SHA* extends the *SNA* production boundary by including imputed production for the value of health services produced within the household that are covered partially or completely by dependency allowances. For example, if households receive cash payments to cover household labor services provided to persons with severe functional mobility or cognitive handicaps, these are treated as social benefits in the *SNA* (not part of production), whereas in the *SHA* they are treated as quasi-salaries with a corresponding production value that is included in current health expenditure.
- 23. A third difference is the *SHA* considers goods purchased and resold by retailers as their intermediate consumption, whereas the *SNA* excludes them from intermediate consumption, which yields two consequences: 1) manufacturers of health care goods are excluded from the *SHA* provider classification and 2) retailers' output is measured in the *SHA* by the sum of the total value of the goods they purchase for resale plus the trade margins realized, while in the *SNA* only the latter component is included. This different treatment should have no impact on either measured final output or measured consumption.
- 24. The final difference enumerated in *SHA 2011* is that research and development (R&D) is treated as a non-financial asset in the *SNA*, and hence, R&D produced on own-account is part of hospital output (and recorded as gross fixed capital formation in the same industry), while the *SHA* core measures exclude this creation of R&D. R&D is discussed in *SHA 2011* on page 267. The reason for treating R&D as an input in the production process (i.e. intermediate consumption) instead of capitalizing it is guided by practical considerations. At the time of the preparation of *SHA 2011*,

information on R&D in the health system was available only for a few countries, so its inclusion would likely impair international comparability of the data.

3 Conceptual Issues and Coverage of the Accounts

3.1 Paid Long-Term Social Care Services

- 25. The SHA is related to increased information on health care services, access to it, and changes in health policy priorities. Recall the intent of health accounts is to describe a health system from an expenditure perspective. Only expenditures on health care are defined within the system. Often distinguishing health care expenditures from social care expenditures is difficult, especially for long-term care (LTC). The SHA clearly establishes a borderline between LTC (health) and LTC (social) (SHA 2011, pp. 88-95). However, the handbook highlights that health care related classifications also identify policy relevant areas that go beyond the health care boundary as programs that come under the social part of long-term care (SHA 2011, p. 74).
- 26. Since social care services are also important for household well-being and for policymaking, social care services should be taken into consideration. The *SHA* does this by including LTC (social) as a memorandum item in the classification of health care functions. The memorandum item for LTC (social) comprises expenditures on lower level social care services to assist with **instrumental activities of daily living** (IADL) such as shopping, laundry, and cooking (*SHA 2011*, p. 114). Also, other social care services such as child welfare could be included. However, as a first step, inclusion of what is already discussed in the *SHA 2011*, i.e., LTC (social), could be a starting point.

3.2 Unpaid Household Care Services

- 27. Household production of health care is included in the *SHA* framework however, limited to those health services whose costs are partially or completely covered by dependency allowances. The transfers will be treated as a quasi-salary in the SHA and a corresponding "production value" is calculated. Justifications for measuring unpaid household production of health and social care are evident in a number of sources. Stiglitz et al. (2009) argue that focusing solely on market activity provides a biased picture of living standards, especially when economic activity appears to increase but is simply the result of a shift from household production to the market provision of similar services. Hanly and Sheerin (2017) focus on heightened demand for unpaid long-term care putting pressure on the provision of informal care in the home, which at the same time is experiencing limited supply because of female labor force participation and loosening of community and family ties. It is therefore, recommended that all unpaid household production of health and social care, and not limited to what is already recorded in the SHA, is included in the extended accounts in the *SNA*.
- 28. Gender differences also play a role in the importance of official statistics on unpaid household production of health care. Ferrant et al. (2014) conclude that the majority of informal care is undertaken by women, which negatively impacts their participation in the labor force and in education. Likewise, Hanly and Sheerin (2017) argue that neglecting unpaid care work leads to incorrect inferences about levels and changes in individuals' well-being, which in turn limits policy effectiveness for gender inequalities in employment and empowerment areas.
- 29. Overall, the literature supports the view that unpaid household care has a significant role in understanding health and social conditions and individuals' well-being. Valuation of unpaid production of health and social care should be carried out in line with international guidelines for valuing unpaid Health and Social Conditions December 2021

household work and it would be beneficial if the guidelines in the SHA 2011 were updated accordingly and, thus, extend the imputations which is presently based on dependency allowances.

3.3 Occupational health care – ancillary activities

30. Occupational health care provided by organizations for their employees is treated as "final consumption expenditure" of health in the *SHA*, whereas in the *SNA* it is recorded as an ancillary activity and recorded as intermediate consumption. In the *SNA* supply and use tables, output includes the value of the enterprises' purchased health goods and services provided as intermediate consumption, but it does not impute own-account provision of such services within an organization unless that organization is a health provider. Theoretically, to record the total expenditure of occupational health care, this should cover output both from the health providers and own-account provision (see <u>Table 11</u> and <u>Table 12</u> in the annex of this note). The authors of this Guidance Note examined whether own-account production of occupational health services should be imputed as secondary output of the employer and allocated to intermediate consumption (GDP should be unaffected). It is considered that such an imputation can be difficult to implement and therefore it is not included in the recommendations. However, the conclusion is to follow the guidelines in the *SHA* and, if own-account occupational health care is recorded, the output should also be included in Tables 11 and 12 in the extended accounts.

3.4 Measuring Volumes of Health Services

31. To analyze health output developing over time, it is recommended to compile health expenditure in constant prices/volume terms. This should be carried out consistently with volume estimates of health services in the core accounts. Recommendations in the Eurostat *Handbook on Prices and Volume Measures in National Accounts* are based on the following definition of health output: "Health output is the quantity of health care received by patients, for each type of health care." The quantities/volumes should be weighted together using data on the costs or prices of the health care provided." There are many obstacles in doing so especially for health services from by non-market providers. Consistent with *SNA* recommendations and conclusions of country experiences, research should continue to better understand the quality of health care and to best reflect quality changes in volume measures of health care services in the core national accounts. This will also lead to improvements in indicators presented in extended or supplementary tables.

4 Recommendations

32. It is recommended to build health indicators based on the well-developed framework in *SHA 2011*. This proposal provides extensions of the central framework to expand official measures of well-being. There is also one recommendation affecting the core accounts.

4.1 Proposed Changes to the Central Framework of the SNA 2008 (Core)

This Guidance Note recommends that:

33. Health expenditure is compiled both in current and constant prices/volume terms. However, to improve volume measures of health and social care services, further research and experimentation is needed - in particular to better understand quality of health and social care so that changes in quality of care can be captured in the measures.

4.2 Proposals for Extended or Supplementary Tables (Non-Core)

This Guidance Note makes the following recommendations:

34. To present additional indicators of health based on the system of health accounts in the *SHA* 2011 in extensions of the *SNA* core framework (see **Box 1**). The extensions should be based on analyzing health expenditures as equal to health output provided to individuals. Based on experiences learned from the coronavirus pandemic, in future there might be demand for other ways of splitting health care by policy-relevant characteristic, implying that the extended accounts should be built in a flexible way.

Box 1: Additional Indicators

Indicators for health and social care should be built from the expenditure flow data in the extended accounts. This covers individual final consumption expenditures of health and social care with various breakdowns defined mainly by health care function, provider, and financing scheme, see examples in Table 10 in the annex. These data can also be cross tabulated according to various combinations. It should be noted that "final" consumption expenditure in the extended tables includes also intermediate consumption related to occupational health care.

The following standardizations and additional breakdowns of final consumption expenditures for domestic uses over time are proposed: expenditures as a share of GDP, per capita expenditures, expenditure by health care function, expenditure by age and gender of beneficiaries, and expenditure by income group of beneficiaries. Indicators constructed from *health expenditure* data and combined in various ways with other indicators, will allow for a range of analyses of household well-being.

In addition, the financing scheme is important, allowing for example to analyze the shares between health care expenditures paid out of own pocket or by private insurance, government, or non-profits and health care received as transfers in kind.

Indicators in physical terms such as employment in health and social care should be considered as well as a breakdown by the International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO-08) characteristics of employed persons. The most relevant ISCO groups for health are sub-major group 22 (health professionals) and 32 (health associate professionals). Physical measures of assets could also be presented with a suitable breakdown (e.g. number of hospital beds available).

Experience developed in the course of *SHA* data collection could be used to define distinctions for health insurance along dimensions including voluntary/compulsory, private/public, and individual/social as a supplement to the *SNA* central system.

- 35. The broader framework on well-being and sustainability should include all expenditures on health and social care. Health expenditure are defined in *SHA 2011*. Social care is not part of health expenditure but is discussed in the *SHA* and reported as a memorandum item. The approach described in the *SHA 2011* for estimating expenditure on social care can be used as a starting point.
- 36. The production boundary should be expanded to include imputed values for unpaid household production of health care and long-term social care (see <u>Table 8</u> in the annex). This should be carried out in line with the recommendations of valuation of unpaid household work in Guidance Note *WS.3*: *Unpaid Household Service Work*. It is recognized that this will not be in complete harmony with *SHA 2011*, which limits the imputations to the costs of non-market health and social care services that are covered by dependency allowances. We therefore recommend that the *SHA* revise their guidelines accordingly.
- 37. By including the expenditure data in extended accounts, allow the aggregation of individual consumption expenditure on health and social care in a different way than in the core accounts, providing useful information for policy makers.

- 38. Create extended supply and use tables for health care and long-term social care. Using a supply and use framework should help ensure consistency and completeness of the analysis of health care and social care. An example of how to build the supply and use tables are given in the annex, <u>Table 11</u> and <u>Table 12</u>, <u>while Table 13</u> indicates how to build the financing by sector and health functions. To simplify the tables, only one-digit levels of the classifications are used.
- 39. The differences between *SHA 2011* and *SNA* are in practice marginal. It is recommended that the *SNA* concepts and definitions are used in the extended accounts and it is also recommended that *SHA* harmonize the guidelines accordingly. Double work and inconsistency between the systems should be avoided. Therefore, it is considered important that *SHA* and *SNA* are harmonized to the extent possible, see proposal in paragraph 40.
- 40. The classifications for functions (HC), providers (HP) and financing schemes (HF) from *SHA* 2011 should be included in the *SNA* for use in the extended accounts, after an assessment is made of whether the *SHA* functional classification (HC) defines the most relevant supplementary details for health and social care in a national accounting context. Some elements of the *SHA* classification should be reexamined for this purpose (e.g. the feasibility of distinguishing expenditures between curative and rehabilitative care).

4.3 Proposed Changes to the SHA 2011

This Guidance Note also makes the following recommendations:

- 41. Harmonization of *SHA 2011* and the *SNA* to the extent possible should be a goal, and there are some changes required to *SHA 2011*. First, the most important is to recognize expenditures on R&D in health as capital formation. Second, the valuation of unpaid household work should be extended to cover all household production of health and social care beyond what is now included in the SHA based on dependency allowances.
- 42. The product classification of *Annex E* of *SHA 2011* should also be reviewed to ensure consistency with the *SNA*. Even though there may be differences regarding details in the two systems, they should be consistent at an aggregate level. The review could include identification of additional products that are relevant for policy decisions, based on details in the *SNA* supply and use tables.
- 43. There should be a review of the SHA classifications and COICOP 2018 to ensure consistency between the classifications and, thus, help linking procedures.

5 Questions for Consultation

Relevance of topic

1. Is this topic of relevance for your country (low/medium/high)?

Core accounts:

2. Do you support the proposal to improve methods for estimating health expenditure in constant prices/volume terms including accounting for treatment of changes in the quality of care, following further research/experimentation? *Yes/No. If no, please explain.*

Extensions/supplementary tables:

- 3. Do you agree with including in extensions of the SNA core framework a set of additional indicators of health shown in Box 1, based on the system of health accounts in the SHA 2011? Yes/No. If yes, do you have any views on indicators that you would prioritize to include or exclude? If no, please explain.
- 4. Do you agree with the proposal to extend the production boundary in extended or supplementary tables to include unpaid household provision of health and social care? Yes/No. If yes, do you have specific recommendations? If no, please explain.
- 5. Do you agree with the creation of extended supply and use tables for health care and social care to help ensure consistency and completeness of the analysis of health and social care? *Yes/No*.
- 6. Do you agree with including in the *SNA*, for use in the extended accounts, the *SHA 2011* classifications of health care functions (HC), health care providers (HP), and financing schemes (HF)? *Yes/No*.

Feasibility and other comments

- 7. How do you regard the feasibility of the options in this Guidance Note? (0-10 from not feasible at all to highly feasible) *If you have comments about the feasibility of specific proposals, please provide details.*
- 8. Do you have any other comments in relation to the proposals in this Guidance Note?

References

Chari, Amalavoyal V., John Engberg, Kristin N. Ray, Ateev Mehrotra. 2015. The Opportunity Costs of Informal Elder-Care in the United States: New Estimates from the American Time Use Survey, *Health Services Research*, 50(3), pp. 871-882.

Dauda, Seidu, Abe Dunn, Anne Hall. 2019. Are Medical Care Prices Still Declining? A Systematic Examination of Quality-Adjusted Price Index Alternatives. BEA Working Paper 2019-3.

Eisner, Robert. 1995. Expansion of Boundaries and Satellite Accounts in *The New System of National Accounts*, ed., John W. Kendrick, Springer, pp. 91-119.

European Commission, International Monetary Fund, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, United Nations, World Bank. 2009. *System of National Accounts 2008*, New York, NY: United Nations.

Eurostat. 2016. Handbook on Prices and Volume Measures in National Accounts.

Ferrant, Gaëlle, Luca Maria Pesando, Keiko Nowacka. 2014. Unpaid Care Work: The Missing Link in the Analysis of Gender Gaps in Labour Market Outcomes. OECD Development Centre Issues Paper.

Hall, Anne. 2016. Adjusting the Measurement of the Output of the Medical Sector: A Review of the Literature, *Medical Care Research and Review*, 74(6), pp. 639-667.

Hanly, Paul, Corina Sheerin. 2017. Valuing Informal Care in Ireland: Beyond the Traditional Production Boundary, *The Economic and Social Review*, 48(3), pp. 337-364.

OECD. 2018. Accounting and Mapping of Long-Term Care Expenditure under *SHA 2011*. OECD Directorate for Employment, Labour, and Social Affairs.

OECD, Eurostat, World Health Organization. 2017. A System of Health Accounts 2011: Revised edition, OECD Publishing, Paris.

Oliva-Moreno, Juan, Maria Luz Pena-Longobardo, Cristina Vilaplana-Prieto. 2015. An Estimation of the Value of Informal Care Provided to Dependent People in Spain, *Applied Health Economics and Health Policy*, 13(2), pp. 223-231.

Stiglitz, Joseph E., Amartya Kumar Sen, Jean-Paul Fitoussi. 2009. Report by the Commission on the Measurement of Economic Performance and Social Progress. Commission on the Measurement of Economic Performance and Social Progress, Paris.

United Nations. Central Product Classification, version 2.1. New York: United Nations.

United Nations Economic Commission for Europe. 2017. *Guide to Valuing Unpaid Household Service Work*. Geneva: United Nations.

Annex A: Tables

Table 1: Health Care Product Classification in the SHA

Code	Description	CPC Code	CPA Code
01	Hospital services	9311	86.1
01.1	Hospital surgical services	93111	86.10.11
01.2	Hospital gynaecological and obstetrical services	93112	86.10.12
01.3	Hospital rehabilitation services		86.10.13
01.4	Hospital psychiatric services	93113	86.10.14
01.5	Intensive care services		
01.9	Other hospital services	93119	86.10.15
02	Day care services		
02.1	Day care surgical services		
02.2	Day care gynaecological and obstetrical services		
02.3	Day care rehabilitation services		
02.4	Day care psychiatric services		
02.5	Other day care services		
03	Medical and dental practice services	9312	86.2
03.1	General medical practice services (outpatient)	93121	86.21
03.2	Specialist medical practice services	93122	86.22
03.3	Dental practice services	93123	86.23
04	Other medical services	9319	86.9
04.1	Midwives' services	93191	86.90.11
04.2	Nursing services	93192	86.90.12
04.3	Physiotherapeutic services	93193	86.90.13
04.4	Patient transport services, among others ambulance services	93194	86.90.14
04.5	Medical laboratory services	93195	86.90.15
04.6	Diagnostic imaging services without interpretation	93196	86.90.17
04.7	Blood, sperm and transplant organ bank services	93197	86.90.16
04.9	Other medical services n.e.c.	93199	86.90.19
05	Residential care services	932	87
05.1	Residential nursing care services	9321	87.1
05.9	Other residential care services	9330	87.90
06	Nursing care services without accommodation	934	88
06.1	Nursing care services without accommodation for the elderly and disabled		88.1
06.9	Other nursing care services without accommodation	935	88.9

Source: Adapted from *SHA 2011* pp. 468-495. Note: CPC = Central Product Classification (in the *SNA*); CPA = Classification of Products by Activity (the European equivalent of the CPC).

Table 1: Health Care Product Classification in the SHA (continued)

Code	Description	CPC Code	CPA Code
07	Retail trade services in medical products	62	47
07.1	Retail trade services of pharmaceutical goods and medical non-	62273	47.00.74
	durables		
07.2	Retail trade services of medical durables and orthopaedic products	62274	7.00.75
07.3	Retail trade services of optical goods and services of opticians		
07.4	Mail order or internet retail trade services in medical products		623
07.9	All other retail trade services in medical products and their repair		
08	Preventive services		
08.1	Information and counselling programs		
08.2	Immunization programs		
08.3	Early disease detection programs		
08.4	Health condition monitoring programs		
08.5	Epidemiologic surveillance and risk and disease control programs		
08.6	Disaster and emergency response programs of health systems		
00.0	Disaster and emergency response programs or nearth systems		
09	Governance, management, and health system administration	91	87
09.1	Governance and administrative health (excluding those for	911	84.1
	mandatory schemes)		
09.2	Administrative services regarding mandatory schemes	913	84.3
10	Health insurance, except mandatory schemes		65
10.1	Health insurance services	7132	65.12.1
11	Health and social care goods and services produced by households		
	for own use		
MP.1			
MP.2			
MP.3			
MP.4	1 . 15 . 914 2014 . 460 405		

Source: Adapted from SHA 2011 pp. 468-495.

Note: CPC = Central Product Classification (in the *SNA*); CPA = Classification of Products by Activity (the European equivalent of the CPC).

Table 2: Classification of Health Care Functions in the SHA at First-Digit Level

HC.1	Curative care
HC.2	Rehabilitative care
HC.3	Long-term care (health)
HC.4	Ancillary services (non-specified by function)
HC.5	Medical goods (non-specified by function)
HC.6	Preventive care
HC.7	Governance and health system and financing administration
HC.9	Other health care services not elsewhere classified (n.e.c.)
	Memorandum items: Reporting items
HC.RI.1	Total pharmaceutical expenditure
HC.RI.2	Traditional complementary alternative medicines
HC.RI.3	Prevention and public health services (according to SHA 1.0)
	Memorandum items: Health care related
HCR.1	Long-term care (social)
HCR.2	Health promotion with a multi-sectoral approach

Source: Adapted from SHA 2011 table 5.1.

Table 3: Classification of Health Care Providers in the SHA at First-Digit Level

HP.1	Hospitals
HP.2	Residential long-term care facilities
HP.3	Providers of ambulatory health care
HP.4	Providers of ancillary services
HP.5	Retailers and providers of medical goods
HP.6	Providers of preventive care
HP.7	Providers of health care system administration and financing
HP.8	Rest of economy
HP.9	Rest of the world

Source: Adapted from SHA 2011 table 6.2.

Table 4: Classification of Health Care Financing Schemes in the SHA at First-Digit Level

HF.1	Government schemes and compulsory contributory health care financing schemes
HF.2	Voluntary health care payment schemes
HF.3	Household out-of-pocket payment
HF.4	Rest of world financing schemes (non-resident)

Source: Adapted from SHA 2011 table 7.3.

Table 5: Correspondence between ICHA-HC and CPC Ver. 2

ІСНА-НС	Function	CPC Code	Title		
HC.1	Curative care				
HC.1.1	Inpatient curative care	9311	Inpatient services		
HC.1.2	Day curative care	93119	Other services for inpatients		
HC.1.3	Outpatient curative care	9312	Medical and dental services		
HC.1.4	Home-based curative care	93121	General medical services		
		93122	Specialized medical services		
		93192	Nursing services		
		93199	Other human health services, n.e.c.		
HC.2	Rehabilitative care				
HC.2.1	Inpatient rehabilitative care	9311	Inpatient services		
		93119	Other services for inpatients		
HC.2.2	Rehabilitative day care	93119	Other services for inpatients		
HC.2.3	Rehabilitative outpatient care	93121	General medical services		
		93122	Specialized medical services		
		93193	Physiotherapeutic services		
		93199	Other human health services, n.e.c.		
HC.2.4	Rehabilitative home-based care	As above	As above		
HC.3	Long-term care (health)				
HC.3.1	Inpatient LTC (health)	93210	Residential health care services		
		93301	Residential care services		
HC.3.2	Day cases of LTC (health)	93210	Residential health care services		
HC.3.3	Outpatient LTC (health)	93192	Nursing services		
HC.3.4	Home-based LTC (health)	93192	Nursing services		
		93199	Other human health services, n.e.c.		
HC.4	Ancillary services, n.s.f.		,		
HC.4.1	Laboratory services, n.s.f.	93195	Medical laboratory services		
HC.4.2	Imaging services, n.s.f.	93196	Diagnostic imaging services		
HC.4.3	Patient transportation, n.s.f.	93194	Ambulance services		
HC.5	Medical goods				
HC.5.1	Pharmaceuticals and other	62273	Specialized retail trade of pharma		
HC.5.2	Therapeutic appliances and other	62274	Specialized retail trade of medical		
HC.6	Preventive care		1		
HC.6.1	Information, educ, counselling	91122	Public administrative services		
		9312	Medical and dental services		
HC.6.2	Immunization	As above	As above		
HC.6.3	Early disease detection	As above	As above		
HC.6.4	Health condition monitoring	As above	As above		
HC.6.5	Epidemiologic surveillance	As above	As above		
HC.6.6	Disaster and emergency response	As above	As above		
HC.7	Governance and administration				
HC.7.1	Governance and health sys. adm.	91122	Public administrative services		
	,	91310	Administrative services related to		
HC.7.2	Adm. of health financing	71322	Health insurance services		
-		91310	Administrative services related to		

Source: Summarized from SHA 2011 table A.1.7.

Note: ICHA-HC = Classification of Health Care Functions in the System of Health Accounts 2011.

Table 6: Correspondence between ICHA-HP and ISIC Rev. 4

ІСНА-НР	Type of Provider	ISIC Code	Categories	
HP.1	Hospitals			
HP.1.1	General hospitals	8610	Hospital activities	
HP.1.2	Mental health hospitals	8610	Hospital activities	
HP.1.3	Specialized hospitals	8610	Hospital activities	
HP.2	Residential LTC facilities			
HP.2.1	LTC nursing facilities	8710	Residential nursing care facilities	
HP.2.2	Mental health facilities	8720	Residential care activities	
HP.2.9	Other residential LTC facilities	8730	Residential care activities	
		8790	Other residential care activities	
HP.3	Providers of ambulatory care			
HP.3.1	Medical practices	8620	Medical and dental practices	
HP.3.2	Dental practices	8620	Medical and dental practices	
HP.3.3	Other health care practitioners	8690	Other human health activities	
HP.3.4	Ambulatory care centers	8620	Medical and dental practices	
HP.3.5	Providers of home health care	8690	Other human health activities	
		8810	Social work activities	
HP.4	Providers of ancillary services			
HP.4.1	Patient transportation and rescue	8690	Other human health activities	
HP.4.2	Medical and diagnostics labs	8690	Other human health activities	
HP.4.9	Other ancillary services	8690	Other human health activities	
HP.5	Retailers and other providers			
HP.5.1	Pharmacies	4772	Retail sale of pharmaceuticals	
HP.5.2	Retail sellers of medical goods	4773	Other retail sale of new goods	
HP.5.9	Miscellaneous suppliers	4772	See above	
		4773	See above	
HP.6	Providers of preventive care	8412	Regulation of activities	
HP.7	Administration and financing			
HP.7.1	Government health adm.	8412	Regulation of activities	
HP.7.2	Social health insurance agencies	8430	Compulsory social security	
HP.7.3	Private health insurance agencies	6512	Non-life insurance	
HP.8	Other secondary providers			
HP.8.1	Households	9820	Private households for own use	
HP.8.1	Households	9820	Private households for own use	

Source: Summarized from SHA 2011 table A.1.10.

Note: ICHA-HP= Classification of health care providers in the system of Health Accounts 2011.

Table 7: Relation of Consumption to SNA and SHA Aggregates

	SNA 2008	SHA 2011
Final	P.31 Individual consumption expenditure	SHA additionally includes
consumption	on health +	a) Occupational health care
expenditure	P.32 Collective consumption expenditure	(intermediate consumption within
on health	on health	establishments) minus an estimated
care	=	share of occupational health in the net
	P31 – Households individual consumption	administration of health providers and
	of health +	other medical industries.
	P31 – NPISH individual consumption of	b) "Remunerated" household
	health +	production in the form of social benefits
	P31 – Government individual consumption	in cash for home care of sick, disabled
	of health (part of COFOG 07)	and elderly persons provided by family
	P32 – Government collective consumption	members usually for the purpose of
	of health (part of COFOG 07)	LTC.
		c) "Health care activities" not classified
		as health care in SNA, e.g., health care
		in social care institutions, or
		administration of social insurance. The
		borderlines in the SNA are determined
		by COICOP and COFOG.

Source: Extract from table A.1.1. of SHA 2011.

Table 8: Own-Use Production Work of Service Activities and Market Counterparts

	CPC		ISIC
	Ver. 2.1		Rev.4
Child Care	93222	Residential care services for young disabled persons	8720
	93301	Residential care services for children suffering from mental	8790
		retardation, mental health illnesses, or substance abuse	
	93302	Other social services with accommodation for children	8810
	93492	Other social services without accommodation for children	8710
Adult Care	93210	Residential health care services other than by hospitals	8730
	93221	Residential care services for the elderly	8730
	93223	Residential care services for disabled adults	8720
	93303	Residential care services for adults suffering from mental	8790
		retardation, mental health illnesses, or substance abuse	
	93304	Other social services with accommodation for adults	8810
	93411	Vocational rehabilitation services for persons with disabilities	8890
	93412	Vocational rehabilitation services for unemployed persons	8810
	93491	Other social services without accommodation for the elderly	9609

Source: Extract from table 4.1 of the UNECE Guide to Valuing Unpaid Household Service Work.

Table 9: Questions to Identify Households Providing Health Care or Social Care

Number	Question				
16	Do you have any of the following long-lasting conditions or difficulties?				
	(a) Blindness or a serious vision impairment				
	(b) Deafness or a serious hearing impairment				
	(c) A difficulty with basic physical activities such as walking, climbing stairs,				
	reaching, lifting or carrying				
	(d) An intellectual disability				
	(e) A difficulty with learning, remembering or concentrating				
	(f) A psychological or emotional condition				
	(g) A difficulty with pain, breathing, or any other chronic illness or condition				
17	If 'Yes' to any of the categories specified in Question 16, do you have any difficulty in				
	doing any of the following?				
	(a) Dressing, bathing or getting around inside the home				
	(b) Going outside the home alone to shop or visit a doctor's surgery				
	(c) Working at a job or business or attending school or college				
	(d) Participating in other activities, for example leisure or using transport				
22	Do you provide regular unpaid personal help for a friend or family member with a long-				
	term illness, health problem or disability?				
	Include problems which are due to old age				
	Personal help includes help with basic tasks such as feeding or dressing				
	If 'Yes', for how many hours per week?				

Source: Extract from the Census of Population of Ireland. The 2016 form is available on the Central Statistics Office at: https://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/census/census/2016/2016censusforms/65995 English Household 2016 New Version Do Not Complete.pdf.

Table 10: Indicators Based on Final Consumption Expenditures and Capital Formation

				Per	Percent-
				Capita	age of
Axis	Indicator	CU	%GDP	CU	CHE
	Total current health and social care expenditure	X	X	X	
General	Total current health expenditure plus capital	X	X	X	
	spending				
	Preventive spending				X
	Curative spending				X
Health	Inpatient spending				X
Functions	Outpatient spending				X
runctions	Total pharmaceutical spending	X	X	X	X
	Health expenditures on LTC	X			X
	Social care (spending	X			X
	Hospital health spending				X
Providers	Ambulatory health spending				X
	Social care spending				X
	Government health schemes				X
Financing Schemes	Compulsory contributory health insurance				X
	Voluntary health insurance				X
	Out of pocket health expenditures				X
Capital Formation	Total public spending on capital formation	X			X
	Total private spending on capital formation	X			X
	Spending on capital formation by hospitals	X			X

Source: Adapted from table 15.1 of *SHA 2011*. CU = currency unit (national, USD, or Euro), CHE = current health expenditures and adjusted for the inclusion of social long-term care.

Table 11 Health output, by provider and health functions. Current prices.

Supply		HP.1 Hospitals	HP.2 Residential long-term care facilities	HP.3 Providers of ambulatory health care	HP.4 Providers of ancillary services	HP.5 Retailers and other market producers of medical goods	Providers of	IP.7 roviders of lealth care ystems and inancing	econdary	mports	Taxes less subsidies on products	ital
Health functions and Social care function	HC.1 Curative care HC.2 Rehabilitative care HC.3 Long-term care (health)											
	HC.4 Ancillary services (non- specified by function											
	HC.6 Preventive care HC.7 Governance and health systems and financing											
	administration H.C.9 Other health care services not elsewhere classified											
	HCR.1 Long- term care (social)											
Total output = Total current expenditure												
R&D (ov	n account											

Table 12 Health expenditure, by consumer and health function. Current prices.

Use										
		Final consumption exp	oenditures				Intermediate			
		Central government	State government	Local government	NPISH	House- holds	consumption – market producers	Exports	Total	
	HC.1 Curative care									
	HC.2 Rehabilitative care									
	HC.3 Long-term care (health)									
	HC.4 Ancillary services (non- specified by function									
Health functions	HC.5 Medical goods n.s.f.									
and Social	HC.6 Preventive care									
care function	HC.7 Governance and health systems and financing administration									
	HC.9 Other health care services not elsewhere classified									
	HCR.1 Long term care (social)									
Total out	tput									
(interme	diate and final									
	otion) = Total									
current e	expenditure									
		Gross fixed south	ol formatia	s in boolek :	adusta.	(ICIC OF)				
		Gross fixed capital formation in health industry (ISIC 85)								
		Central govern- ment	State govern- ment	Local govern- ment	NPISH		Market producers in education industry		Total	
R&D (both purchased and produced for own account)										
	ormation									
	ss fixed capital									

Table 13 Financing, by sector and health function. Current prices.

	Health and social care functions Health and social care functions										
		HC.1 Curative care	HC.2 Rehabili- tative care	HC.3 LTC health	HC.4 Ancillary services	HC.5 Medical goods	HC.6 Preventive care	HC.7 Governance and health systems and financing administration	HC.9 Other health care services not elsewhere classified	HCR.1 LTC social	Total
Resource	es										
Central govern- ment	Final consumption expenditure of central government Plus - transfers / subsidies to										
	other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	Less – transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	Central government financing										
State govern- ment	Final consumption expenditure of state government										
	Plus - transfers / subsidies to other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	Less - transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	State government financing										
Local govern- ment	Final consumption expenditure of local government										
	Plus - transfers / subsidies to other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	Less - transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)										
	Local government financing										

NPISH	Final consumption expenditure of NPISH						
	Plus - transfers to other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
	Less – transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
	NPISH financing						
	Final consumption expenditure of households						
House-	Plus - transfers to other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
holds	Less – transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
	Household financing						
	Intermediate consumption						
Other	Plus - transfers to other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
sectors ³	Less – transfers / subsidies from other sectors (detail to be country specific)						
	Other sectors financing						
Rest of the world (exports)							
Tatal us	-						
Total reso	urces						

 $^{^{3}}$ Corporate sectors and households as producers. Health and Social Conditions – December 2021