ESA/STAT/AC.140/2.1 English only

Engendering development statistics: An opportunity to remedy past neglect *

Prepared by

Ms. Francesca Perucci United Nations Statistics Division

^{*} This document is being reproduced without formal editing

Engendering development statistics: An opportunity to remedy past neglect

Francesca Perucci, United Nations Statistics Division

The new framework for monitoring development

The adoption of the Millennium Declaration in 2000 by all member states of the UN was a defining moment for the international community. The Declaration, the culmination of a series of international conferences and summits beginning in 1990 with the World Summit for Children, embodied a synthesis of the goals set by these international development conferences and of a body of international norms and laws that had been codified over the previous half-century. The new monitoring requirements stemming from these eight universally-agreed "Millennium Development Goals" (MDGs), as they are now known, have shaped the development of indicators and related statistical capacity-building programmes over the past few years.

As reflected in the MDGs, the Declaration also represented a new approach to development, with a full recognition that development is not exclusively economic, but also embraces human social and environmental dimensions. The MDGs also reflect a shift in emphasis from inputs to results and, importantly, the Declaration set specific measurable and time-bound targets for each Goal, with progress to be measured on the basis of a list of internationally-agreed indicators.

The first seven of the MDGs provide development objectives to be achieved by the developing countries. Goal 8, reflecting the partnership between developing and developed countries that is the cornerstone of the Millennium Declaration, contains targets for the various forms of assistance to be provided by the developed countries to support the developing countries' efforts to reach their goals. Collectively, the MDGs have achieved an unprecedented degree of recognition and a tangible commitment from all countries to use them as a framework for development.

The establishment of the MDGs was followed by the identification of an agreed set of targets and indicators to measure achievements (see Annex 1) and the establishment of the United Nations Inter-agency and Expert Group (IAEG) on MDG Indicators, tasked with the production and analysis of the necessary data. The IAEG, in turn, created a number of sub-groups to cover specific goals or topics, including a Sub-Group on Gender Indicators. The MDG indicators, based on established principles and practices of official statistics, have now become a broadly recognized framework for monitoring and for statistical development. They are now widely accepted and used in national, regional and international programmes for monitoring and evaluating implementation of the Goals and for developing statistical capacity building programmes and initiatives. Supplemented by more detailed national data, and with appropriate adaptation to national needs and circumstances, they are also increasingly being used to help design and manage national policies aimed at achieving the Goals.

The Millennium Declaration and the establishment of the MDGs as a framework to track progress have also brought about an increased recognition of the importance of statistics for policy-making and monitoring. Systematic and sustained tracking of progress is now widely recognized as a necessary condition for the achievement of the Goals. Monitoring keeps the spotlight firmly on the Goals, informing global and national campaigns and turning the Goals and targets into widely recognized measures of successful development and of international cooperation in support of development.

The MDG monitoring requirements and their political importance have also reversed the long period of neglect of statistics and highlighted the overall lack of adequate statistical capacity in many developing countries. There is now higher recognition and awareness of the urgent need to build national capacity for monitoring and reporting on Goals and targets and for producing the statistics to inform the necessary development policies. This was the basis for launching important initiatives for statistical capacity-building. The Marrakech Action Plan for Improving Development Statistics¹ was a major step in this direction. Good statistics are now seen as an integral component of good governance at both national and international levels.

Unfortunately, most of the initiatives originating from the "MDG effect" have ignored the development of gender statistics. Moreover, as discussed in the following sections, the MDG monitoring framework also fails to fully capture the gender dimension of development and the different outcomes of progress on women and men. Nevertheless, since the start of the monitoring of the MDGs, considerable work has gone on to make the framework more gender-sensitive,

Does the monitoring of the MDGs appropriately assess progress towards gender equality?

Ensuring equal opportunities across population groups is an intrinsic aspect of development and is instrumental to achieve poverty reduction. (World Bank 2005) Since in many countries around the world women and men have different access to assets and opportunities, gender inequality results in what the World Bank report refers to as the "inequality trap", reproducing further inequalities with negative consequences for women's well-being, their families, and their communities.

Poverty incidence tends to be lower in countries with more gender equality. This relationship is quite robust to various measures of poverty and of gender equality. Moreover, whether engaged in self-employment or wage employment, working women contribute to household income and expenditure. In poor households, such contributions can be crucial for keeping the household out of poverty and this is an important reason to increase access to education, to markets (for labor, land and credit), and to technology. Gender equality also contributes to future poverty reduction through the impact on children's accumulation of human capital and the potential impact on aggregate saving.

Among the MDGs, Goal 3 is to "Promote gender equality and empower women". There is also compelling evidence that gender equality and women's empowerment are necessary to attaining the other MDGs—universal primary education, lower under-five mortality, improved maternal health, and lower likelihood of contracting HIV/AIDS.

¹ "Better Data for Better Results. An Action Plan for Improving Development Statistics", Presented to the Second International Roundtable on Managing for Development Results, Marrakech, Morocco, February 4-5, 2004.

Women's education, health, and greater control over household resource allocation improve children's well-being. Studies from developing and developed countries consistently show that when mothers have greater control over resources, more resources are allocated to food and to children's health, nutrition and education (and thus to the attainment of these other MDGs).

Recognizing all this, we would expect governments to place gender equality and the empowerment of women at the center of all their development policies and plans. Similarly, we would expect the statistics and indicators used to monitor the MDGs and to inform the necessary policies to fully reflect the situation of women and men. But this is often not the case. Consequently, two immediate priorities in almost all countries, including those where some progress is being made, are to honor prior international commitments to mainstream gender and the empowerment of women into all development policies and to ensure that data are available to support this effort and to identify the progress that is being achieved.

Monitoring Progress towards Goal 3

Progress toward Goal 3 is monitored on the basis of the following three indicators related to the domains of education, employment and political participation:

- **Ratio of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education**, calculated as the ratio between the female Gross Enrolment Ratio and the male Gross Enrolment Ratio for the given level of education.
- Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector, calculated as the share of female workers in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector as a percentage of total wage employment in the same sector.
- **Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament,** calculated as the female share of total seats.

Since the beginning of the monitoring exercise, these indicators under Goal 3 have been considered insufficient to measure progress in all dimensions of gender equality and women's empowerment. The sub-group on gender indicators, working within the Interagency and Expert Group on MDG Indicators, has addressed all these shortcomings.

The share of women in wage employment was considered by the sub-group inadequate for the following reasons: 1) the indicator ignores the large proportion of women working in agriculture; 2) the indicator is difficult to interpret, unless information is provided on the share of women in total employment; 3) The indicator does not distinguish between the different types of non-agricultural wage employment and these may vary in terms of earnings, social protection, and job security; 4) The indicator does not measure the various dimensions of women's employment that are relevant to women's status and empowerment—such as employment status, benefits, labour regulations and policies.

ILO initiated work to collect data to compile the indicator of the share of women in wage employment. By the end of 2005, 37 countries had sent valid replies, but only 11 of them had provided complete information. The weak response was due in part to real lack of

data in countries, but also to the fact that, even when data are collected, they are not tabulated and systematically reported to the international agencies.

Problems were also identified with the use of the indicator on gender parity in school enrolment and the discussion within the sub-group focused on the use of the Net Enrolment Ratio versus Gross Enrolment Ratio (where NER is defined as pupils of official age in correct level as a proportion of the population of official age, and GER as all pupils in correct level as a proportion of the population of official age). The sub-group also highlighted the importance of integrating the use of administrative education data with data from household surveys. Household surveys, although measuring attendance and not enrolment, can be used to complement the information derived from administrative records from Ministry of Education and to link school attendance with household characteristics. The two agencies responsible respectively for data collection from administrative sources and household surveys, UNESCO and UNICEF, initiated work to integrate the two sources. The process was difficult and is still ongoing. Underlying the problem are issues related to data availability and quality.

Goal 3 indicators have the additional shortcoming of only capturing some dimensions of equality and not attempting to measure progress towards empowerment. Although other aspects of women's lives are covered by some of the other goals, few of the indicators under those goals are appropriate or sufficient to fully assess the situation of women and men. For instance, none of the indicators under goal 1, on the eradication of poverty and hunger, are suitable to understand what progress has been achieved by poor women and what effects gender inequality has had on the lack of progress. Also, few of the health indicators are available by sex and few are suitable for gender analysis.

Experts in the sub-group on gender indicators made several recommendations to improve the indicators covering two of three dimension under Goal 3—education and work—and health. The set of indicators proposed in 2005 is presented in Box 1. With regard to health indicators, the proposal by the group was to include indicators to monitor the empowerment of women in the sphere of reproductive health and their ability to control their reproductive life.

Box 1. Indicators to Monitor Progress on MDG 3 and other MDGs, as proposed by the IAEG sub-group on gender indicators

Education

- Under MDG 2: net and gross enrolment ratios to monitor gender differentials in primary education
- Under MDG 3: net attendance ratios to monitor gender differentials in all three educational levels (primary, secondary and tertiary) with data obtained from household sample surveys to complement information on net enrolment from administrative data.

Reproductive Health

- Move indicator 19c "Contraceptive Prevalence Rate" from goal 6 (HIV/AIDS) to goal 5 (maternal mortality)
- New indicators for sexual and reproductive health rights to be used to monitor progress under Goal 3:
 - "Unmet need for family planning", defined to be the proportion of all women who are fecund, sexually active, wish to avoid another birth or space at least two years and are not using a method of contraception.
 - "Age specific fertility rate, 15-19 years old" as an indicator of empowerment as well as health.

Employment

- New indicator, "Share of women in employment by type,":
 - o 1. Share of women in total employment;
 - 2. Share of women in agricultural employment;
 - 3. Share of women in non-agricultural wage employment (current MDG indicator);
 Of which: 3.1 Informal wage employment;
 - 4. Share of women in non-agricultural self-employment;
 - Of which: 4.1 informal self-employment;

Health

- Need to have data disaggregated by sex to the largest extent possible, on health indicators (child mortality, child malnutrition, TB, HIV/AIDS).
- Access to drugs by sex (in particular antiretroviral drugs).
- Indicator on "domestic violence": Proportion of women who ever had a partner, 15-49 years old, who have ever experienced physical violence by an intimate partner.

The sub-group extensively discussed the importance of collecting and reporting data by sex to WHO and to other UN Agencies and Health Information Systems. The need to have data on access to drugs by sex (in particular antiretroviral drugs, given the impact of AIDS in some regions) was especially emphasized. Progress in this area has been particularly slow and still most of the health indicators are only presented for the total population. Only three indicators in the international MDG database—all of them related to HIV/AIDS--are currently presented by sex.

The sub-group also agreed to propose a measure of the burden of violence against women, defined as the proportion of women who ever had a partner, 15-49 years old, who report having experienced physical violence in the past year at the hand of an intimate partner. The differences between this indicator and those proposed in the past are: (a) the focus on women aged 15-49 (to be consistent with DHS, the data source providing most of the data currently available); and (b) the use in the denominator of only women who ever had a partner (thus at risk of domestic violence), rather than all women.

As for other areas, the group had to recognize that the current data availability was still insufficient to produce the indicator for all regions and for two points in time (for trend analysis) and that the focus should be on promoting adequate data collection programmes. The sub-group also pointed out the need for establishing a standard and regular data collection process and agreed that the addition of a module on domestic violence in all DHS and MICS surveys would be a good way forward.

Box 2. Indicators on reproductive health included in the new MDG monitoring framework, as presented to the 62nd session of the General Assembly in September 2007

Target 5.B: Achieve, by 2015, universal access to reproductive health

5.1. Contraceptive prevalence rate

5.2. Adolescent birth rate

- 5.3. Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits)
- 5.4. Unmet need for family planning

In March 2007, the IAEG agreed on a set of new indicators to track progress on four new targets introduced by member states at the 2005 World Summit and presented to the UN General Assembly at its 62nd session in September 2007. By the time the IAEG agreed on the new indicators to be presented to the General Assembly for inclusion in the official MDG framework, the sub-group on gender indicators had decided not to go forward with its entire proposal, with the exception of the indicators on reproductive health. A slight modification of two of the indicators proposed are now part of the new MDG monitoring framework, and are being used to monitor progress towards achieving the goals (see Box 2). Once again, the lack of data from official sources had dictated the choice.

The Millennium Project Task Force on Gender also suggested additional indicators for monitoring progress under goal 3 and in the seven strategic priorities they identified for the achievement of the goal, at both the country and international level. The Task Force's recommended 12 indicators are presented in box 4 below.²

² United Nations Millennium Project Task Force on Education and Gender Equality. Final Report, *Taking Action: Achieving Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women*, October 2004.

Box 3: Indicators proposed by MP Task Force 3 (new indicators are in italics) <u>Education</u>

• Ratio of female to male gross enrolment rates in primary, secondary and tertiary education.

• *Ratio of female to male completion rates in primary, secondary and tertiary education.*

Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights

- Proportion of demand for contraception satisfied
- Adolescent fertility rate

Infrastructure

• Hours per day (or year) women and men spend fetching water and collecting fuel

Property Rights

- Land ownership by sex
- Housing title, disaggregated by male, female or jointly held

Employment

- Share of informal employment, both waged and self-employed, by sex in nonagricultural employment.
- Gender gaps in earnings in paid and self-employment.

Participation in National Parliaments and Local Government Bodies

- Percentage of women-held seats in national parliament
- Percentage of women elected to local government bodies

Violence against Women

• Prevalence of domestic violence

Of all indicators proposed by the Millennium Project or by the IAEG sub-group, only the two now part of the new monitoring framework can be reasonably used across countries. The remainder could not be adopted for global monitoring because of lack of data. Consequently, with the exception of the reproductive health indicators, none of the proposals of the IAEG sub-group or the Millennium Project have been incorporated in the list of MDG targets and indicators. However, both sets of recommendations have established the basis for the work underway to improve data production. This work is also supported by recommendations and international agreements and mandates of the past few decades. But progress has been very slow, mainly because the work on gender statistics remains confined to a limited part of the statistical system, often managed by gender statistics focal points or units, and not fully mainstreamed in the production of all statistics. Improving countries' capacity to produce and use gender statistics remains a priority.

The need to mainstream gender into statistical systems

All statistics, including those not directly related to individuals, ultimately are intended to support improvements in the living conditions of women and men and in the functioning of societies. An effective statistical system should take into account the varieties of situations of individuals (women and men) in society, the impact of changes in macroeconomic variables on people's lives and the effect of individual choices and contributions on country's performance.

Over the last few decades, many international instruments – UN world conferences and other international fora – have attempted to incorporate a gender perspective in all policy areas, in order to make policies more effective. To the same end, some governments have designed and implemented new mechanisms to ensure that gender issues are mainstreamed in all national policies and programmes. These efforts however have often been undermined by the lack of adequate data to inform and monitor policies.

To support the production, compilation and analysis of data needed to address gender issues and concerns in different areas, specific programmes were developed over the last few decades in some National Statistical Offices, as well as in international agencies. These programmes have proven to be effective instruments for improving concepts and methods to better reflect the realities of women and men in various statistical fields. They have also been essential for the improvement of data analysis, presentation and dissemination–crucial elements for advocating greater attention to the gender perspective in all areas of statistical work. Examples are the increasing number of compilations of statistics on women and men presented in publications or other forms of data repositories, produced by national statistical offices.

Progress has been made also in the development of methods and classifications. For instance, new standards have been endorsed at the international level to better measure women's work and contribution to the economy—such as the inclusion of unpaid work for own consumption in what is to be considered "economic". The SNA93 introduces the inclusion within the production boundary of all goods produced, even those of own-account production that are retained by their producers for their own final consumption or gross capital formation. All goods produced by households, even those not destined for the market, are then treated the same way as goods produced for the market and are to form part of total production of the nation and part of GDP. As this type of work is mainly carried out by women, this innovative treatment, when duly implemented, better reflect the participation of women in the national economy. However, the full implementation of this expanded framework for the consideration of economic activities has been seriously restricted by the lack of statistics. Most of the household activities (in large part carried out by women) are difficult to measure and are not captured by conventional methods of data collection.

Box 4. What is gender mainstreaming in official statistics?

Mainstreaming a gender perspective in statistics involves integrating gender issues and concerns in the overall production of all official statistics. This implies that all statistics are collected, compiled and analyzed taking in consideration factors that affect and define women's and men's situations and experiences. Concepts and methods used in data collection need to be adequately formulated to reflect gender concerns and differentials, and to take into consideration social and cultural factors that can produce gender-based biases in data collection, analysis and presentation. These statistics are not necessarily and not only statistics disaggregated by sex. They not only provide a comparison between women and men, but also an analysis of women's and men's participation in and contribution to all social and economic areas, as well as a measurement of the outcome of this participation and contribution. Women and men's experiences differ significantly because of gender-based factors and inequalities.

A gender perspective should be mainstreamed in the existing structure of the entire statistical system, rather than confining the production and compilation of "gender statistics" to one separate unit or programme.

Conclusions and the way forward

The call for improved availability of data on women and men started with the first World Women's Conference in 1975. At the end of the women's decade, in Nairobi, the first comprehensive compilation of gender statistics was presented. Ever since, gender advocates and many statistical experts have promoted the improvement of concepts and methods to better reflect gender issues and differences in official statistics. More than thirty years on, the data available from official national and international sources do not allow us to monitor the basic aspects of development related to gender and to inform policies with statistics and indicators that fully reflect women and men's differences and roles in all economic and social areas.

Progress has been very slow and the major advances in the pre-Beijing period have slackened in the post-Beijing era. Major initiatives have been launched to accelerate progress towards the MDGs, including programmes for the development and strengthening of national statistical systems. None of them fully addresses the need to include a gender perspective. In spite of all the evidence that link women's empowerment and gender equality to poverty eradication and the achievement of most of the other MDGs, gender has remained a marginal component of strategies and plans.

The current availability of statistics from national official sources indicate that statistical systems have failed to fully integrate a gender perspective in all areas of statistical production and to provide policy makers with the kind of data required for gender-sensitive policy formulation.

Recently, the urgency for development partners to address the lack of data to monitor development goals and enable countries to produce the data necessary for policy formulation has become more evident. For instance, the newly established Steering Group and Working Group on MDG in Africa, includes the establishment of a thematic group on statistical system. The thematic group is tasked with the development of strategies and concrete recommendations to accelerate progress in statistical development in the continent. The Inter-agency and Expert group on MDG Indicators has also addressed the need to strengthen statistical capacity in countries. International agencies, donors and representatives from national statistical offices in the IAEG have worked together to identify national priorities in capacity building and to make specific recommendations for the improvement of the delivery and coordination of statistical assistance to countries.

In March 2006, the United Nations Statistical Commission, comprised of representatives of national statistical services, also called the attention of member states to the urgent need of building statistical capacity in countries where resources are limited. The resolution on Statistical Capacity Building proposed by the Commission was approved by the Economic and Social Council in July 2006.

For gender mainstreaming in statistics to be fully effective and to improve the availability and quality of data on women and men, statisticians concerned with the development of gender statistics need to become fully involved in the implementation of these initiatives and programmes.

There is little or nothing that is new in what has to be done. What is new is that the MDGs have not only created the need but also provided an opportunity to improve data and gender-based data. The environment is new: statistics are finally getting both attention and additional resources and the opportunity should not be lost to ensure that the need for improved gender data is addressed. At the same time, given the importance of the MDG framework for the development of statistics, it is important that recommendations on the improvement of gender statistics be framed around it, to ensure the collection and tabulation of not only data specified by the framework but also related data that provide fuller understanding of the situation of women and men in countries and show progress in moving toward greater equality and out of poverty.

Annex 1

Revised Millennium Development Goal monitoring framework, including new targets and indicators, as recommended by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goal Indicators and noted by the General-Assembly at its 62nd Session, September 2007

At the 2005 World Summit (see General Assembly resolution 60/1), world leaders committed themselves to achieving four targets additional to the ones included in the United Nations Millennium Declaration (resolution 55/2). The General Assembly, in its decision 61/504, took note of the report of the Secretary-General on the work of the Organization, in which he recommended the inclusion of four new targets (A/61/1, para. 24).

The technical work for the selection of the appropriate indicators for the new targets was undertaken by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goal Indicators, coordinated by the Department of Economic and Social Affairs. The Group is mandated to prepare statistics and analyses on trends related to the Millennium Development Goals and to review methodologies and technical issues in relation to the indicators.

The new formulation of the monitoring framework, including the new targets and corresponding indicators as recommended by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group, is presented below.

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and Targets * (from the Millennium Declaration)	Indicators for monitoring progress*
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	
Target 1: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day	 Proportion of population below \$1 (PPP) per dayⁱ Poverty gap ratio Share of poorest quintile in national consumption
Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	Growth rate of GDP per person employed Employment-to-population ratio Proportion of employed people living below \$1 (PPP) per day Proportion of own-account and contributing family workers in total employment
Target 2: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger	 Prevalence of underweight children under-five years of age Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education	
Target 3: Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling	 Net enrolment ratio in primary education Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary** Literacy rate of 15-24 year-olds, women and men**
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women	
Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015	 9. Ratios of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education 10. (dropped)ⁱⁱ 11. Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector 12. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament

Where relevant, indicators will be calculated by sex and by urban and rural areas.

Goal 4: Reduce child mortality	
Target 5: Reduce by two thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five	13. Under-five mortality rate
mortality rate	14. Infant mortality rate
	15. Proportion of 1 year-old children immunised against measles
Goal 5: Improve maternal health	
Target 6: Reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio	 Maternal mortality ratio Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel
Achieve, by 2015, universal access to reproductive health	19c. Contraceptive prevalence rate ⁱⁱⁱ Adolescent birth rate
	Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits) Unmet need for family planning
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases	
Target 7: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS	 HIV prevalence among population aged 15-24 years Condom use at last high-risk sex Proportion of population aged 15-24 years with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non- arrhene aged 10-14 years
Achieve, by 2010, universal access to treatment for HIV/AIDS for all those who need it	orphans aged 10-14 years Proportion of population with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs
Target 8: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases	 Incidence** and death rates associated with malaria Proportion of children under 5 sleeping under insecticide-treated bednets and proportion of children under 5 with fever who are treated with appropriate antimalarial drugs** Incidence,** prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis Proportion of tuberculosis cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability	
Target 9: Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country	 25. Proportion of land area covered by forest 27. (dropped)^{iv} 28. Carbon dioxide emissions, total, per capita and per \$1 GDP (PPP), and consumption of ozone-depleting substances^{**} 29. (dropped)^v Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits Proportion of total water resources used
Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss	26. Proportion of terrestrial and marine areas protected** Proportion of species threatened with extinction
Target 10: Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation	 30. Proportion of population using an improved drinking water source** 31. Proportion of population using an improved sanitation facility**
Target 11: By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum-dwellers	32. Proportion of urban population living in slums ^{vi,**}
Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development	
Target 12: Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non- discriminatory trading and financial system	Some of the indicators listed below are monitored separately for the least developed countries, Africa, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States.
Includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty	Official development assistance (ODA)

reduction – both nationally and internationally	33. Net ODA, total and to the least developed countries, as percentage of OECD/DAC donors' gross national income
Target 13: Address the special needs of the least developed countries	 Proportion of total bilateral, sector-allocable ODA of OECD/DAC donors to basic social services (basic education, primary health
Includes: tariff and quota free access for the least developed countries'	care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation)
exports; enhanced programme of debt relief for heavily indebted poor countries and cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous	 Proportion of bilateral official development assistance of OECD/DAC donors that is untied
ODA for countries committed to poverty reduction	 ODA received in landlocked developing countries as a proportion of their gross national incomes
	37. ODA received in small island developing States as a proportion of
Target 14: Address the special needs of landlocked developing countries	their gross national incomes
and small island developing States (through the Programme of Action for	Market access
the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States and the outcome of the twenty-second special session of the General Assembly)	 Proportion of total developed country imports (by value and excluding arms) from developing countries and least developed
Target 15: Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing	countries, admitted free of duty 39. Average tariffs imposed by developed countries on agricultural
countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term	products and textiles and clothing from developing countries
	 Agricultural support estimate for OECD countries as a percentage of their gross domestic product
	41. Proportion of ODA provided to help build trade capacity
	Debt sustainability
	 42. Total number of countries that have reached their HIPC decision points and number that have reached their HIPC completion points (cumulative)
	 43. Debt relief committed under HIPC and MDR/ Initiatives **
	44. Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services
Target 16: replaced by new target in Goal 1	45. (Replaced by new indicators in Goal 1) ^{vii}
Target 17: In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access	46. Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs
to affordable essential drugs in developing countries	on a sustainable basis
Target 18: In cooperation with the private sector, make available the	47a. Telephone lines per 100 population **
benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications	47b. Cellular subscribers per 100 population**
	48. Internet users per 100 population**
Abbreviations: PPP, purchasing power parity; GDP, gross domestic produc	t: OECD, Organization for Economic Cooperation and

Abbreviations: PPP, purchasing power parity; GDP, gross domestic product; OECD, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development; DAC, Development Assistance Committee; HIPC, heavily indebted poor countries; MDRI, Multilateral Debt Relief Initiative.

* The numbering of the targets and indicators will be undertaken through the inter-agency process of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goal Indicators.

** The language has been modified for technical reasons, so that the data can be more clearly reflected.

ⁱ For monitoring country poverty trends, indicators based on national poverty lines should be used, where available.

^{iv} Previously: "Energy use (kg oil equivalent) per \$1 GDP (PPP)".

^{vi} The actual proportion of people living in slums is measured by a proxy, represented by the urban population living in households with at least one of the four characteristics: (a) lack of access to improved water supply; (b) lack of access to improved sanitation; (c) overcrowding (3 or more persons per room); and (d) dwellings made of non-durable material.

vii Previously: "Unemployment rate of young people aged 15-24 years, each sex and total".

ⁱⁱ Previously: "Ratio of literate women to men, 15-24 years old".

Moved from goal 6.

^v Previously: "Proportion of population using solid fuels".