HEALTH EQUITY ASSESSMENT IN INDONESIA

Nunik Kusumawardani, MScPH, PhD
Research Centre for Public Health Development
National Institute of Health Research and Development
Ministry of Healthy – Republic of Indonesia

International Workshop on Data Disaggregation for the Sustainable Development Goals
UN ESCAP Bangkok,
January 30, 2019
Presentation outline

• Capacity building for health inequality monitoring in Indonesia: enhancing the equity orientation of country health information system
• Report on State of Health Inequality in Indonesia
• Publication on Global Health Action Journal
• Key messaged and ways forward to address issues of health inequity
Total population: 237,556,363 people (119,507,580 males and 118,048,783 females) in 2010. Indonesia has 1128 ethnics, 17.504 islands (6000 inhabited)
Capacity building for health inequality monitoring in Indonesia

- Indonesia population characteristics
  - Diversity in cultural, social, economy and geography
  - High number of population
  - District level authorization
- There were no specific measurement of health equity lead to policy implication in Indonesia
- WHO introduced the components of health inequality monitoring tool, the HEAT plus, in collecting, analyse and reporting of data disaggregation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Training workshop using HEAT</td>
<td>April 2016</td>
<td>Outline for data source mapping exercise and health inequality report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Follow up technical meeting</td>
<td>May 2016</td>
<td>Data source mapping and list of indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Data preparation</td>
<td>May-Aug 2016</td>
<td>Disaggregated data using HEAT plus - 1st version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Follow up technical meeting</td>
<td>Aug 2016</td>
<td>Disaggregated data using HEAT plus - 1st version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Data preparation and import to HEAT Plus</td>
<td>Sept – Nov 2016</td>
<td>Master data for HEAT plus – 1st version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Training workshop using HEAT plus</td>
<td>November 2016</td>
<td>First draft of national report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Follow up technical meeting</td>
<td>February 2017</td>
<td>Revised report – 2nd version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Data clinic and paper/report write-up workshop</td>
<td>April 2017</td>
<td>Outline of papers; key section of report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Report review meeting</td>
<td>September 2017</td>
<td>Feedback and technical editing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Report launching</td>
<td>December 2017</td>
<td>Final report book</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Submission of papers for publication</td>
<td>July 2017 – February 2018</td>
<td>Submission ready manuscript</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Capacity building for health inequality monitoring in Indonesia: enhancing the equity orientation of country health information systems

Ahmad Reza Hosseinpoor, Devaki Nambiar, Jihane Tawilah, Anne Schlotheuber, Benedicte Briot, Massee Bateman, Tamzyn Davey, Nunik Kusumawardani, Theingi Myint, Mariet Tetty Nurayetty, Sabarinah Prasetyo, Suparmi and Rustini Floranita

*Department of Information, Evidence and Research, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland; World Health Organization, New Delhi, India; The George Institute for Global Health, Sydney, Australia; National Institute of Health Research and Development, Ministry of Health, Jakarta, Republic of Indonesia; World Health Organization, Jakarta, Republic of Indonesia; The US Agency for International Development, Jakarta, Indonesia; School of Public Health, The University of Queensland, Brisbane, Australia; National Institute of Health Research and Development, Ministry of Health, Jakarta, Republic of Indonesia; Badan Pusat Statistik, BPS-Statistics, Jakarta, Indonesia; Faculty of Public Health, Universitas Indonesia, Depok, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Background: Inequalities in health represent a major problem in many countries, including Indonesia. Addressing health inequality is a central component of the Sustainable Development Goals and a priority of the World Health Organization (WHO). WHO provides technical support for health inequality monitoring among its member states. Following a capacity-building workshop in the WHO South-East Asia Region in 2014, Indonesia expressed interest in incorporating health-inequality monitoring into its national health information system.

Objectives: This article details the capacity-building process for national health inequality monitoring in Indonesia, discusses successes and challenges, and how this process may be adapted and implemented in other countries/contexts.

Methods: We outline key capacity-building activities undertaken between April 2016 and December 2017 in Indonesia and present the four key outcomes of this process.

Results: The capacity-building process entailed a series of workshops, meetings, activities, and processes undertaken between April 2016 and December 2017. Each stage, a range of stakeholders with access to the relevant data and capacity for data analysis, interpretation and reporting was engaged with, under the stewardship of state agencies. Key steps to strengthening health inequality monitoring included capacity building in (1) identification of the health topics/areas of interest, (2) mapping data sources and identifying gaps, (3) conducting equity analyses using raw datasets, and (4) interpreting and reporting inequality results. As a result, Indonesia developed its first national report on the state of health inequality. A number of peer-reviewed manuscripts on various aspects of health inequality in Indonesia have also been developed.

Conclusions: The capacity-building process undertaken in Indonesia is designed to be adaptable to other contexts. Capacity building for health inequality monitoring among countries is a critical step for strengthening equity-oriented national health information systems and eventually tackling health inequities.

Background

Inequalities in health outcomes, access/use of health services, and in health behaviors represent a recalcitrant problem in many countries, including Indonesia [1,2]. Addressing health inequality is a central component of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG): the concept of ‘leaving no one behind’ is at the bedrock of the health-related SDG 3 and the corresponding Target 3.8 for Universal Health Coverage [3-6]. Linked to this is the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) target of ‘reducing the mortality rate of all causes for all ages, including disabilities, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts’ [4].

The mandate of the World Health Organization (WHO) includes providing technical support and building capacity for health inequality monitoring among member states [7-10]. Capacity building in health inequality monitoring at the country level includes development of both knowledge and skills, as outlined in Figure 1. Anticipating the capacity needed for health-inequality monitoring.
Key points for accomplishment

- Data availability
- Partnership from universities, statistic office and health programs
- High commitment and effective coordination and teamwork
- Substantial technical supports from WHO and other related organizations
Challenges

• National data quality
• Routine inequity report for trend analysis to measure progress
• Sufficient availability of data that covers input, process and outcome indicators of health development inequity
• Equity analysis:
  • More specific equity dimensions
  • Multivariate analysis of equity intervention modelling
• Data disaggregation format (survey data based vs HEAT)
Products of capacity building

- Health Inequity report
- Journal articles publication
- Gain knowledge and capacity in measuring health inequity
- Networking and collaboration to address health inequity issues
Report on equity assessment:
- 11 health topics
- Equity measurement results
- Disaggregated data by sub-national, sex, age groups, education, economy, occupation
- Policy implication
- National data: Riskesdas 2013 (Basic Health Survey), Social economy survey, Tuberculosis survey
- Facility report data: health personnel.
- Facility based survey: Rifaskes 2011
Special issues:
Monitoring health inequality in Indonesia

- Capacity building
- Short communication
- Method forum
- Original articles
- Current debates
Subnational regional inequality in the public health development index in Indonesia

Suparmi a, Nunik Kusumawardani a, Devaki Nambiar b, Trihono c and Ahmad Reza Hosseinpoor d

aNational Institute of Health Research and Development, Ministry of Health, Jakarta, Republic of Indonesia; bGeorge Institute for Global Health, New Delhi, India; cHealth Policy Unit, Ministry of Health, Jakarta, Republic of Indonesia; dInformation, Evidence and Research, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland

ABSTRACT
Background: Achieving the Sustainable Development Goal of ‘ensuring healthy lives and promoting well-being for all at all ages’ necessitates regular monitoring of inequality in the availability of health-related infrastructure and access to services, and in health risks and outcomes.

Objectives: To quantify subnational regional inequality in Indonesia using a composite index of public health infrastructure, services, behavioural risk factors and health outcomes: the Public Health Development Index (PHDI).

Methods: PHDI is a composite index of 30 public health indicators from across the life course and along the continuum of care. An overall index and seven topic-specific sub-indices were calculated using data from the 2013 Indonesian Basic Health Survey (RISKESDAS) and the 2011 – Village Potential Survey (PODES). These indices were analysed at the national, province and district levels. Within-province inequality was calculated using the Weighted Index of Disparity (IDISW).

Results: National average PHDI overall index was 54.0 (out of a possible 100); scores differed between provinces, ranging from 43.9 in Papua to 65.0 in Bali. Provinces in western regions of Indonesia tended to have higher overall PHDI scores compared to eastern regions. Large variations in province averages were observed for the non-communicable diseases sub-index, environmental health sub-index and infectious diseases sub-index. Provinces with a similar number of districts and with similar overall scores on the PHDI index showed different levels of relative within-province inequality. Greater within-province relative inequalities were seen in the environmental health and health services provisions sub-indices as compared to other indices.

Conclusions: Achieving the goal of ensuring healthy lives and promoting well-being for all at all ages in Indonesia necessitates having a more focused understanding of district-level inequalities across a wide range of public health infrastructure, service, risk factor and health outcomes indicators, which can enable geographical comparison while also revealing areas for intervention to address health inequalities.
Figure 4. Public Health Development Index (overall index): province average and relative within-province inequality, Indonesia, RIKESDAS, 2013.

Note: Dashed orange lines indicate the median values.
Key messages

• Inequity still occurred in Indonesia health development, in term of issues magnitude as well as health resources. This fact lead to strengthen utilization of financial support from central Government as well as to direct the technical support for district health development.

• Data disaggregation and health inequity should be incorporated in the national information system for routine monitoring
Ways forward to address issues of health inequity

- Routine monitoring on health inequity
- More specific and sensitive intervention to close the health inequity towards positive health outcome
- Stronger collaboration with non health sectors to improve health status among specific population groups
- Technical supports for certain geographical areas with poorer health outcome.
Reproducibility of the capacity building process

The capacity building process can be replicated by other countries that have required data sources for health inequality monitoring.
Acknowledgment

High appreciation and thank you to:
- DG of Indonesia NIHRD MoH
- WHO team (Indonesia, SEARO, HQ) for valuable technical supports.
- Health Inequality analysis team, including from BPS (Statistic Indonesia), Universities and other UN family as well to NIHRD researchers for all the hard working and coordination for the analysis and report.
Example of disparity in Health Facility

Well-built facility of PHC in Cibodas - West Java - 2015

Limited facility of PHC in Murung Raya – Central Kalimantan - 2015
Thank you very much

Terimakasih