

## Comments from UN Statistical System - Goal 17

Based on Documents:

(1) 'Summary of comments (25 September 2015) - List of indicator proposals (11 August 2015)' sourced from: <http://unstats.un.org/sdgs/meetings/iaeg-sdgs-meeting-02>

(2) 'Detailed Inputs from IEAG-SDGs Members and Observers during open consultation (15 September 2015)' sourced from: [http://unstats.un.org/sdgs/files/open-consultation-iaeg/Open\\_Consultation\\_Compilation-Members\\_and\\_Observers-20150915.pdf](http://unstats.un.org/sdgs/files/open-consultation-iaeg/Open_Consultation_Compilation-Members_and_Observers-20150915.pdf)

(3) 'Results of the IEAG Questionnaire with Indicator Groupings' (circulated on 22 October 2015) sourced from: <http://unstats.un.org/sdgs/files/meetings/iaeg-sdgs-meeting-02/Member%20Responses%20to%20Questionnaire%20on%20Indicator%20Proposals/Results%20of%20IAEG%20Questionnaire%20with%20Indicator%20Groupings.pdf>

General Comments:

The UNSS has updated or modified the position posted on the comments page (September 5), having reviewed the many comments and suggestions made the member states, civil society, private industry etc.

We are not clear how the Green/Yellow/Grey classification was determined or awarded. In any event, even for some of the indicators classified as "green" we are suggesting slight changes, having reviewed all the comments. Therefore we would ask that some time be allowed to review "green" indicators.

As little time is allowed for comments, we would like to note, we have at all stages taken care to use existing data, in order to minimize burden to member states. In a small number of cases we are proposing new concepts, but we made great efforts to keep this to a minimum.

In a number of cases we are proposing to use the original indicator proposed by TST 17. It is not clear why these were not presented to member states as proposed indicators, or who or why these indicators were changed.

**Target 17.1 Strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to developing countries, to improve domestic capacity for tax and other revenue collection**

Proposed Indicator: Composition of Tax Revenues (by source, including revenues derived from environmental taxes), and as % of GDP

Supplementary Indicator: 17.1.1 Total Tax/GDP

Supplementary Indicator: 17.1.2 Total Tax Per Capita (\$ value)

---

**Status:** Yellow

**Comment:** There is quite mixed reaction to the proposed indicator. The IMF and WB proposed a broader indicator but many others have disagreed. Several of the proposed supplementary indicators would appear to be worthwhile and warrant further investigation to determine whether they can be added to suite of indicators in the future. For the moment however, the UNSS recommends the following:

**Recommendation:** Replace proposed indicator with 'Total Govt Revenues (by source), and as a % of GDP'. Keep supplementary Indicator 17.1.1. Drop supplementary indicator 17.1.2.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Total Govt Revenues (by source), and as a % of GDP

Supplementary Indicator: 17.1.1 Total Tax/GDP

**Target 17.2: Developed countries to implement fully their official development assistance commitments, including the commitment by many developed countries to achieve the target of 0.7 per cent of ODA/GNI to developing countries and 0.15 to 0.20 per cent of ODA/GNI to least developed countries; ODA providers are encouraged to consider setting a target to provide at least 0.20 per cent of ODA/GNI to least developed countries.**

Proposed Indicator: Net ODA, total and to LDCs, as percentage of OECD/Development Assistance Committee (DAC) donors' gross national income (GNI)

Supplementary Indicator: 17.2.1 Net ODA, total and to LDCs, as percentage of OECD/Development Assistance Committee (DAC) donors' gross national income (GNI)

Supplementary Indicator: 17.2.2 Proportion of total bilateral, sector-allocable ODA of OECD/DAC donors to basic social services (basic education, primary health care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation.

---

**Status:** Green

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator 17.2.2 but drop existing supplementary indicator 17.2.1 and replace with it the original proposal from TST 17 ODA Gap i.e. Net ODA [Target 0.7% of GNI] - Net ODA [Actual] as this indicator neatly highlights the shortfall in commitments.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Net ODA, total and to LDCs, as percentage of OECD/Development Assistance Committee (DAC) donors' gross national income (GNI)

Supplementary Indicator: 17.2.1 ODA Gap i.e. Net ODA [Target 0.7% of GNI] - Net ODA [Actual]

Supplementary Indicator: 17.2.2 Proportion of total bilateral, sector-allocable ODA of OECD/DAC donors to basic social services (basic education, primary health care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation

**Target 17.3 Mobilize additional financial resources for developing countries from multiple sources**

Proposed Indicator: Total Capital Inflow

Supplementary Indicator: 17.3.1 Cost of remittances

Supplementary Indicator: 17.3.2 Cost of remittances in the top tier of high-cost corridors

Supplementary Indicator: 17.3.3 Total Official Support for Sustainable Development

---

**Status:** Yellow

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplement it with new supplementary indicator 'Foreign Direct Investments as % of total FDI + ODA'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Total Capital Inflow

Supplementary Indicator: 17.3.1 Foreign Direct Investments as % of total FDI + ODA.

**Target 17.4 Assist developing countries in attaining long-term debt sustainability through coordinated policies aimed at fostering debt financing, debt relief and debt restructuring, as appropriate, and address the external debt of highly indebted poor countries to reduce debt distress**

- Proposed Indicator: Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services
- Supplementary Indicator: 17.4.1 Total number of countries that have reached their Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative (HIPC) decision points and number that have reached their HIPC completion points (cumulative)
- Supplementary Indicator: 17.4.2 Debt relief committed under HIPC initiative
- 

**Status:** Green

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator (as it is already an MDG indicator). Drop supplementary indicators 17.4.1 and 17.4.2 and replace them with new supplementary indicators 17.4.1 'Debt service as a percentage of government revenue' and 17.4.2 'Number of countries in debt distress for two successive years, and number of countries at high and moderate risk of debt distress' or 'The number of countries using the World Bank-IMF LIC Debt Sustainability Framework (DSF) assessed to be "high risk" or "in debt distress"' - the best wording should be determined by experts in this field.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

- Proposed Indicator: Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services
- Supplementary Indicator: 17.4.1 Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services
- Supplementary Indicator: 17.4.2 'Number of countries in debt distress for two successive years, and number of countries at high and moderate risk of debt distress' OR "The number of countries using the World Bank-IMF LIC Debt Sustainability Framework (DSF) assessed to be "high risk" or "in debt distress"

**Target 17.5 Adopt and implement investment promotion regimes for least developed countries**

Proposed Indicator: Number of national & investment policy reforms adopted that incorporate sustainable development objectives or safeguards x country

Supplementary Indicator: 17.5.1 Adoption/Implementation of sustainable development orientated targets by new or existing investment promotion agencies

Supplementary Indicator: 17.5.2 Number of policy changes in investment regimes incorporating sustainable development objectives

-----  
**Status:** Grey

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator 17.5.2. Agree with UNCDF, UNEP, Stockholm Environment Institute and Statistics Denmark that original 17.5.1 should be dropped.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Number of national & investment policy reforms adopted that incorporate sustainable development objectives or safeguards x country

Supplementary Indicator: 17.5.1 Number of policy changes in investment regimes incorporating sustainable development objectives

**Target 17.6 Enhance North-South, South-South and triangular regional and international cooperation on and access to science, technology and innovation and enhance knowledge sharing on mutually agreed terms, including through improved coordination among existing mechanisms, in particular at the United Nations level, and through a global technology facilitation mechanism.**

Proposed Indicator: Access to patent information (WIPO Patent Database) and use of the international IP System

---

**Status:** Green

**Comments:** Several countries do not support this indicator. Cuba and 7 African IAEG members support Cabo Verde and Africa's proposed indicator: "Fixed Internet broadband subscriptions disaggregated by speed", as well as several other countries.

**Recommendation:** In our view the proposed indicator is not actually an indicator and there was no metadata provided. Therefore we propose to use original proposed indicator by TST 17 and supplement it with the indicator 'Fixed broadband subscriptions, broken down by broadband speed'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Percentage increase in jointly filed (international) patents and percentage increase in global revenue from technology licensing/royalties (Royalty & license fees receipts, % total trade)

Supplementary Indicator: 17.6.1 Fixed broadband subscriptions, broken down by broadband speed

**Target 17.7 Promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries on favourable terms, including on concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed**

Proposed Indicator: Average applied tariffs imposed on environmental Goods

Supplementary Indicator: 17.7.1 Total STEM Investment/GDP

Supplementary Indicator: 17.7.2 Total STEM per capita (\$ value)

---

**Status:** Yellow

**Comment:** Concerns that 'environmental goods' are not well defined - this will need to be addressed by WTO members asap.

**Recommendation:** Keep the proposed indicator and drop existing supplementary indicators 17.7.1 and 17.7.2. The UNEP proposal 'Total amount of approved funding for developing countries to promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies on favourable terms, including on concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed' should be adopted as a new supplementary indicator 17.7.1.

It is not clear whether proposed supplementary indicator 17.7.1 is measurable at this stage, therefore additional supplementary indicator proposed by Stockholm Environment Institute i.e. 'Total north-south and south-south funding for technology transfer initiatives' should also be included.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Average applied tariffs imposed on environmental Goods

Supplementary Indicator: 17.7.1 Total amount of approved funding for developing countries to promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies on favourable terms, including on concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed

Supplementary Indicator: 17.7.2 Total north-south and south-south funding for technology transfer initiatives



**Target 17.8 Fully operationalize the technology bank and science, technology and innovation capacity-building mechanism for least developed countries by 2017 and enhance the use of enabling technology, in particular information and communications technology.**

Proposed Indicator: Proportion of individuals using the Internet.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.8.1 Internet penetration

Supplementary Indicator: 17.8.2 Internet access (bandwidth)

---

**Status:** Green

**Comment:** There seems to have been some confusion with this target as several comments seemed to refer to 17.18 rather than 17.8.

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicators 17.8.1 'ICT penetration' is already an established indicator used by 'Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development' and 17.8.2 as they are clear, measurable and enjoy high level of support.

**No Revised UNSS proposal (i.e. proposal stays as):**

Proposed Indicator: Proportion of individuals using the Internet

Supplementary Indicator: 17.8.1 International Internet bandwidth per inhabitant

**Target 17.9 Enhance international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the sustainable development goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation**

Proposed Indicator: The dollar value of financial and technical assistance, including through North-South, South-South, and triangular cooperation, committed to developing countries' designing and implementing a holistic policy mix that aim at sustainable development in three dimensions (including elements such as reducing inequality within a country and governance).

Supplementary Indicator: 17.9.1 Number (share) of national plans to implement SDGs approved by governments by end of 2016 compared to by 2020.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.9.2 Substantial increase in capacity built through south-south cooperation.

---

**Status:** Grey

**Comments:** Several comments note the lack of clarity of proposed indicator and therefore the subsequent measurement problems. We agree.

**Recommendation:** Simplify wording of proposed indicator to read 'The dollar value of financial and technical assistance (including through North-South, South-South, and triangular cooperation) committed to developing countries' design and implementation of policies aimed at sustainable development'. Keep supplementary indicator 17.9.1, drop indicator 17.9.2 and include new indicator 17.9.2 'R&D expenditure as % of GDP (by sector, source of funds, field of science and socioeconomic objective)'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: The dollar value of financial and technical assistance (including through North-South, South-South, and triangular cooperation) committed to developing countries design and implementation of policies aimed at sustainable development

Supplementary Indicator: 17.9.1 Number (share) of national plans to implement SDGs approved by governments by end of 2016 compared to by 2020.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.9.2 R&D expenditure as % of GDP (by sector, source of funds, field of science and socioeconomic objective)

**Target 17.10 Promote a universal, rules-based, open, non-discriminatory and equitable multilateral trading system under the World Trade Organization, including through the conclusion of negotiations under its Doha Development Agenda**

Proposed Indicator: Worldwide weighted tariff-average

Supplementary Indicator: 17.10.1 Stock of potentially trade-restrictive measures in WTO members

**Status:** Green

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator but with original wording as submitted by TST 17 and agreed by UNCTAD-WTO-ITC. Also keep supplementary indicator 17.10.1.

**Target 17.11 Significantly increase the exports of developing countries, in particular with a view to doubling the least developed countries' share of global exports by 2020**

Proposed Indicator: Developing country's and LDCs' exports (by partner group and key sectors), including services.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.11.1 Value of non-oil exports from LDCs that are derived from sustainable management of natural resources

---

**Status:** Green

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator 17.11.1. Also suggest adding UPU suggestion for an additional supplementary indicator 'Developing countries and LDCs' e-commerce flows at the export level (disaggregated by value, volume and product)'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Developing countries and LDCs' exports (by partner group and key sectors), including services.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.11.1 Value of non-oil exports from LDCs that are derived from sustainable management of natural resources

Supplementary Indicator: 17.11.2 Developing countries and LDCs' e-commerce flows at the export level (disaggregated by value, volume and product)

**Target 17.12 Realize timely implementation of duty-free and quota-free market access on a lasting basis for all least developed countries, consistent with World Trade Organization decisions, including by ensuring that preferential rules of origin applicable to imports from least developed countries are transparent and simple, and contribute to facilitating market access**

Proposed Indicator: Average tariffs faced by developing countries and LDCs by key sectors

Supplementary Indicator: 17.12.1 Preferences utilization by developing and least developed countries on their export to developed countries

**Status:** Yellow

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator 17.12.1

**Target 17.13 Enhance global macroeconomic stability, including through policy coordination and policy coherence**

Proposed Indicator: 17.13 GDP

Supplementary Indicator: 17.13.1 Current account surplus and deficit/GDP

---

**Status:** Grey

**Comments:** We agree with comments made by WB, Statistics Denmark, Kefa Finland, Columbia, Capo Verde and Ecuador.

**Recommendation:** Drop proposal to use GDP as a measure of macro-economic stability and use original proposal made by TST 17 which proposed a macro-economic dashboard. Drop 17.13.1.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: 17.13 Macro-Economic Dashboard

## Target 17.14 Enhance policy coherence for sustainable development

Proposed Indicator: Number of countries that have ratified and implemented relevant international instruments including environmental, human rights, and labour instruments

Supplementary Indicator: 17.14.1 Number of countries that have ratified and implemented relevant international instruments under the IMO (safety, security, environmental protection, civil liability and compensation and insurance)

Supplementary Indicator: 17.14.2 Number of countries with multi-sectoral and multi-stakeholder coordination mechanisms in place for a coordinated implementation of chemicals and wastes conventions and frameworks

---

**Status:** Yellow

**Recommendation:** Keep a modified version of the proposed indicator (rewording proposed by ILO - 'Number of countries that have ratified and implemented relevant international instruments under the IMO (safety, security, environmental protection, civil liability and compensation and insurance) and the ILO Maritime Convention, and adopted carbon pricing mechanisms') and supplementary indicator 17.14.1. Drop 17.14.2.

### Revised UNSS proposal:

Proposed Indicator: Number of countries that have ratified and implemented relevant international instruments under the IMO (safety, security, environmental protection, civil liability and compensation and insurance) and the ILO Maritime Convention, and adopted carbon pricing mechanisms

Supplementary Indicator: 17.14.1 Number of countries that have ratified and implemented relevant international instruments under the IMO (safety, security, environmental protection, civil liability and compensation and insurance)

**Target 17.15 Respect each country's policy space and leadership to establish and implement policies for poverty eradication and sustainable development**

Proposed Indicator: Numbers of constraints that are embodied in ODA or loan agreements, IIAs. RTAs etc.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.15.1 Number of countries signing on for sharing of fiscal information

Supplementary Indicator: 17.15.2 Automatic transfer of financial information

---

**Status:** Grey

**Comments:** Comments generally in support on proposed indicator but a lot of concerns expressed regarding the word 'constraints'. However TST 17 identified this as a weak indicator and therefore proposals submitted by Asia Pacific Forum on Women Law and Development and Women's Major Group, Destatis and Statistics Denmark should be considered.

**Recommendation:** Replace proposed indicator with a new indicator 'Number of disputes brought against countries through dispute settlement processes (by companies or countries) in areas such as trade, investment, technology' and drop supplementary indicators 17.15.1 and 17.15.2.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Number of disputes brought against countries through dispute settlement processes (by companies or countries) in areas such as trade, investment, technology



**Target 17.16 Enhance the global partnership for sustainable development, complemented by multi-stakeholder partnerships that mobilize and share knowledge, expertise, technology and financial resources, to support the achievement of the sustainable development goals in all countries, in particular developing countries**

Proposed Indicator: Indicator 7 from Global Partnership Monitoring Exercise: Mutual accountability among development co-operation actors is strengthened through inclusive reviews

Supplementary Indicator: 17.16.1 Changes in the number of multi-stakeholder partnerships participants active in developing countries

Supplementary Indicator: 17.16.2 Classification and trajectory of the above in terms of: a) Nature of partnership, b) Region: Global, regional, c) Objectives: Sharing technology, expertise etc. and d) Country type (where partnership is active).

---

**Status:** Grey

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator. Replace supplementary indicators 17.16.1 and 17.16.2 with 'Number of countries reporting on the full set of SDGs' and with 'Indicator 2 from the Global Monitoring Exercise: Civil society operates within an environment which maximises its engagement in and contribution to development' respectively.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Indicator 7 from Global Partnership Monitoring Exercise: Mutual accountability among development co-operation actors is strengthened through inclusive reviews

Supplementary Indicator: 17.16.1 Number of countries reporting on the full set of SDGs

Supplementary Indicator: 17.16.2 'Indicator 2 from the Global Monitoring Exercise: Civil society operates within an environment which maximises its engagement in and contribution to development'

**Target 17.17 Encourage and promote effective public, public-private and civil society partnerships, building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships**

Proposed Indicator: Amount of US\$ committed to public-private partnerships

Supplementary Indicator: 17.17.1 Number of PPP projects

Supplementary Indicator: 17.17.2 Number of PPP projects implemented by developing countries

---

**Status:** Green

**Comments:** This target provoked quite a bit of comment, much of it negative, expressing dissatisfaction with the proposed indicator. Several comments/queries were raised regarding both the definition of PPP's and whether this was a sensible target. However relatively few alternate proposals were submitted, just comments. This was identified by the original TST 17 as a weak spot and although the original TST 17 indicators are not presented, the indicators that are, are no better.

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator and supplementary indicator 17.17.1. Drop existing supplementary indicator 17.17.2 and replace with 'Number of PPP projects cancelled (source: World Bank (Private Participation in Infrastructure database). Add a third supplementary indicator 17.17.3 ' Public expenditure on public-private partnerships as a percentage of total public expenditure'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Amount of US\$ committed to public-private partnerships

Supplementary Indicator: 17.17.1 Number of PPP projects

Supplementary Indicator: 17.17.2 Number of PPP projects cancelled

Supplementary Indicator: 17.17.3 Public expenditure on public-private partnerships as a percentage of total public expenditure

**Target 17.18 By 2020, enhance capacity-building support to developing countries, including for least developed countries and small island developing States, to increase significantly the availability of high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts**

Proposed Indicator: Proportion of sustainable development indicators with full disaggregation produced at the national level.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.18.1 Number of countries that have national statistical legislation (that [a] enshrine statistical independence; [b] mandate data collection; and [c] secure access to national administrative data.

Supplementary Indicator: 17.18.2 Number of countries that have formal institutional arrangements for the coordination of the compilation of official statistics (at international, national and regional level)

---

**Status:** Green

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicator. Supplementary indicators 17.18.1 and 17.18.2 should be reworded slightly. A third supplementary indicator should also be added.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator: Proportion of sustainable development indicators with full disaggregation produced at the national level

Supplementary Indicator: 17.18.1 Number of countries that have national statistical legislation that complies with the Fundamental Principles of Official Statistics

Supplementary Indicator: 17.18.2 Number of countries that have formal institutional arrangements for the coordination, compilation and access of official statistics to ensure they are disaggregated to the fullest extent possible (at national, regional and international levels)

**Target 17.19 By 2030, build on existing initiatives to develop measurements of progress on sustainable development that complement gross domestic product, and support statistical capacity-building in developing countries.**

Proposed Indicator 1: Financial and other resources made available to strengthen the statistical capacity in developing countries

Proposed Indicator 2: Inclusive Wealth Index

Supplementary Indicator: 17.19.1 Index of Sustainable Economic Welfare (Nordhaus/Tobin)

Supplementary Indicator 17.19.2 Gross National Happiness

---

**Status:** Indicator 1 - Green  
Indicator 2 - Yellow

**Comments:** This is a challenging target comprised of two distinct and separate topics: Consequently it attracted very varied and diverse comments. In general there appears to be broad support for a 'beyond GDP' type indicator, although no consensus on which one is best. We feel it is important to retain some indicator that captures the 'beyond GDP' element of this target.

**Recommendation:** Keep proposed indicators 1 (slightly reworded) and 2. Drop existing supplementary indicators 17.19.1 and 17.19.2 and introduce a single, new supplementary indicator 'Number of countries that report regularly (at least once every three years) on the full suite of SDG indicators'.

**Revised UNSS proposal:**

Proposed Indicator 1: Financial and other resources (quantified in US\$) made available to strengthen the statistical capacity in developing countries

Proposed Indicator 2: Inclusive Wealth Index

Supplementary Indicator: 17.19.1 Number of countries that report regularly (at least once every three years) on the full suite of SDG indicators