

#### https://tinyurl.com/UNBigData2024



#### doi:10.5281/zenodo.11566326



w w w . **c b g p** . u p m . e s



## FAIR Strategies and technologies for early wins

Mark D Wilkinson Isaac Peral Senior Investigator CBGP UPM-INIA/CSIC Universidad Politécnica de Madrid

mark.wilkinson@upm.es

Keynote to #UNBigData2024 June 10, 2024

Centro de Biotecnología y Genómica de Plantas (CBGP, UPM-INIA/CSIC)



## Framing my presentation

FAIR is intended to help machines help people!

Replace time spent in data discovery/manipulation with time spent on thoughtful exploration of global knowledge

IT WORKS! We can now prove it!

We have also experienced some notable failures...









More detail >>

2016

Comment | OPEN

# The FAIR Guiding Principles for scientific data management and stewardship

Mark D. Wilkinson, Michel Dumontier, IJsbrand Jan Aalbersberg, Gabrielle Appleton, Myles Axton, Arie Baak, Niklas Blomberg, Jan-Willem Boiten, Luiz Bonino da Silva Santos, Philip E. Bourne, Jildau Bouwman, Anthony J. Brookes, Tim Clark, Mercè Crosas, Ingrid Dillo, Olivier Dumon, Scott Edmunds, Chris T. Evelo, Richard Finkers, Alejandra Gonzalez-Beltran, Alasdair J.G. Gray, Paul Groth, Carole Goble, Jeffrey S. Grethe, Jaap Heringa, Peter A.C 't Hoen, Rob Hooft, Tobias Kuhn, Ruben Kok, Joost Kok, Scott J. Lusher, Maryann E. Martone, Albert Mons, Abel L. Packer, Bengt Persson, Philippe Rocca-Serra, Marco Roos, Rene van Schaik, Susanna-Assunta Sansone, Erik Schultes, Thierry Sengstag, Ted Slater, George Strawn, Morris A. Swertz, Mark Thompson, Johan van der Lei, Erik van Mulligen, Jan Velterop, Andra Waagmeester, Peter Wittenburg, Katherine Wolstencroft, Jun Zhao & Barend Mons are - Show fewer authors



## The FAIR Guiding Principles...

"This necessitates machines to be capable of autonomously and appropriately acting when faced with the wide range of types, formats, and access-mechanisms/protocols that will be encountered during their self-guided exploration of the global data ecosystem."

https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata201618

When I wrote this paragraph, I was imagining a Web of data discovery and exploration <u>agents</u>





"This necessitates machines to be capable of autonomously and appropriately acting when faced with the wide range of types, formats, and access-mechanisms/protocols that will be encountered during their self-guided exploration of the global data ecosystem."

## Notable consequence #1

FAIR is, first, a mechanism to guide **automated agents** to discovery of task-relevant data

# As a consequence, FAIR is, before all else, about <u>metadata</u>.





"This necessitates machines to be capable of autonomously and appropriately acting when faced with the wide range of types, formats, and access-mechanisms/protocols that will be encountered during their self-guided exploration of the global data ecosystem."

## Notable consequence #2

Creating a Web of data that can be *appropriately* (re)used by machines necessitates specific data publishing behaviors by data providers

These behaviors can be concretely described





"This necessitates machines to be capable of autonomously and appropriately acting when faced with the wide range of types, formats, and access-mechanisms/protocols that will be encountered during their self-guided exploration of the global data ecosystem."

## Notable consequence #2

This means that FAIRness is, by definition,

measurable

by automated agents





## **The FAIR Evaluator**

The first fully-automated "agent" for testing FAIRness of a resource

Resulted from early pressure from e.g. journal editors who wanted to require FAIRness





## http://w3id.org/AmIFAIR

FAIR Evaluation Services	Home evaluations	s metrics - co	LLECTIONS -	Search tests and collection: SEARCH	
FAIR Evaluation Services					
Reso	urces and guidelines to	assess the FAIRn	ess of digital resou	rces.	
	(770)X	(7 dan ve (7 webbin 28			
Create collections       Evaluate resources         Import Maturity Indicators as YAML smartAPI interface annotation       Assemble Maturity Indicators into community centered collections       Evaluate resources FAIRness against Maturity Indicator Collections					
Get started		Get started		Get started	



Any stakeholder provides the URL of any Digital Object, and ~22 distinct tests of "FAIRness" are executed on that Object



## **The FAIR Evaluator Harvester**

At its core, The Evaluator consists of a "very forgiving" <u>metadata</u> harvesting workflow & library





## **The FAIR Evaluator Tests**

FAIR Principle F3: metadata explicitly include the identifier of the data it describes

# Explore the harvested metadata for any metadata facet that *appears to be* a reference to a data record

(there are at least 18 possibilities that are acceptable!)





**Evaluator usage** 

~10,000 FAIRness evaluations run using the public version

Several thousand evaluations run using the private version from my company\*\*

Executions of individual tests are not monitored, but do occur frequently





## FAIR Assessment a cottage industry!

- **22** independent FAIR assessment platforms
- Most are questionnaire-based
- All of them focus on (primarily) metadata
- But, there is a problem! The scores from each platform are different...

Resource 🗸	Execution Type				
5 Star Data Rating Tool	Manual - questionnaire				
Data Stewardship Wizard	Predictive: based on a manually filled questionnaire				
F-UJI	Automated				
FAIR Data Self- Assessment Tool	Manual - questionnaire				
FAIR Evaluator	Automated				
FAIR enough?	Manual - checklist				
FAIR-Aware (BETA)	Manual - questionnaire				
FAIR-Checker	Automated				
FAIRdat	Manual - questionnaire				
FAIRness self- assessment grids	Manual - checklist				
FAIRshake	Manual - questionnaire, Semi-manual				
9.20.00					
https://f	https://fairassist.org				
Model	Manual - checklist				





## How different can they be?

Comparison of The Evaluator\*\* with F-UJI, on the same Digital Object (a Catalog record in the Duchenne Parent Project Patient Registry)



#### 20/22 Tests Pass



2/24 Tests Pass



# The problem of metadata discovery and interpretation

EOSC calls for an investigation of the FAIR assessment discrepancies

## meosc





# meosc

#### EOSC Task Force on FAIR Metrics and Data Quality

#### Co-Chairs:

- Mark D Wilkinson
- Chris Schubert
- Carlo Lacagnina (retired)

## Established November 2021





## Three key outputs v.v. FAIR Testing

## meosc

FAIR Metrics and Data Quality Task Force https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7463421

## FAIR Assessment Tools: Towards an "Apples to Apples" Comparisons

#### Authorship Community:

Mark D Wilkinson<sup>1,3,\*</sup>, Susanna-Assunta Sansone<sup>2,4,\*</sup>, Marjan Grootveld<sup>2,5</sup>, Josefine Nordling<sup>2,6,</sup> Richard Dennis<sup>2,7</sup>, David Hecker<sup>2,8</sup> on behalf of the EOSC FAIR Metrics subgroup

## meosc

FAIR Metrics and Data Quality https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10490289 Task Force

Report on "FAIR Signposting" and its uptake by the community

Mark D Wilkinson<sup>1,3</sup>, Susanna-Assunta Sansone<sup>2,4</sup>, Marjan Grootveld<sup>2,5</sup>, Richard Dennis<sup>2,6</sup>, David Hecker<sup>2,7</sup>, Robert Huber<sup>8</sup>, Stian Soiland-Reyes<sup>9</sup>, Herbert Van de Sompel<sup>5</sup>, Andreas Czerniak<sup>10</sup>, Milo Thurston<sup>4</sup>, Allyson L. Lister<sup>4</sup>, Alban Gaignard<sup>11</sup>

meosc

FAIR Metrics and Data Quality https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7390482 Task Force

## Community-driven Governance of FAIRness Assessment: An Open Issue, an Open Discussion

Authorship Community:

Mark D. Wilkinson<sup>1,3</sup> Susanna-Assunta Sansone<sup>2,4</sup> Eva Méndez<sup>5</sup> Romain David<sup>2,6</sup> Richard Dennis<sup>2,7</sup> David Hecker<sup>2,8</sup> Mari Kleemola<sup>2,9</sup> Carlo Lacagnina<sup>1,10</sup> Anastasija Nikiforova<sup>2,11</sup> Leyla Jael Castro<sup>12</sup>





Delivering the Commons to Plan-Track-Assess research in EOSC (Started in January 2024)

Among its deliverables:

- Harmonization of FAIR Assessment tools, workflows, and APIs\*
- Bootstrapping a global governance process for FAIR testing\*

\* These activities are open to non-project participants, so please contact me if you wish to become involved!





# An example of a successful large-scale FAIRification initiative

The European Joint Programme on Rare Diseases (EJP-RD)







## +1800people **35** participating countries 26 EU MS, 7 associated (AM, CH, GE, IL, NO, RS, TK), UK and CA ALL 24 ERNs 101 M€ **Budget** Union contribution: 55 M€ (70% reimbursement rate)

## **EJP RD in numbers**



Coordinated by

91 beneficiaries
10 hospitals
12 research institutes
31 research funding bodies/ ministries
27 universities/hospital universities
5 EU infrastructures
5 charities/foundations
EURORDIS

+ 52 linked third parties +100% associated networks



GE

Yanis Mimouni, 2021. https://vascern.eu/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/20211008\_EJP-RD\_presentation\_VASCERN.pdf



Yanis Mimouni, 2021. https://vascern.eu/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/20211008\_EJP-RD\_presentation\_VASCERN.pdf



## Step 1 - Focus on Metadata that answers the question: "What kind of data does this partner have"?



#### EJP-RD Metadata Schema:

- Based on DCAT; attempts to follow the European DCAT-AP
- Published by all sites via semi-automated process using Excel spreadsheets



## **EJP-RD Metadata Publication Platform: FDP**



- Open-source, currently distributed via Docker images
- Installs in seconds
- Publishes metadata for human exploration
- Publishes metadata for agent-based exploration
- Provides easy-to-use DCAT editing tools via Web pages
- Automatically registers the new FDP in a central index





# Result: a federated network of FDPs representing all biobanks and patient registries

<b>FAIR Data Point</b> <b>RARE DISEASES</b> FAIR Data Point Metadata for machines			<b>Q</b> Search FAIR Data Point	Log in
FAIR Data Points				
Filter:	All 26	Active 13 Inactive 5	Unreachable 1 Invalid 7	Unknown •
Endpoint 🛦 🔻		Registration 🛦 🔻	Modification 🔺 🔻	Status
https://w3id.org/ctsr-fdp/		15-12-2023, 06:00:00	08-06-2024, 06:00:00	ACTIVE
https://directory.bbmri-eric.eu/api/fdp		04-10-2023, 16:12:15	07-06-2024, 14:00:00	ACTIVE
http://fairdatapointorphanet.info:7070		08-04-2024, 13:32:46	07-06-2024, 12:03:29	ACTIVE
http://45.88.81.224:7070/		19-03-2024, 10:46:34	07-06-2024, 11:46:36	ACTIVE
https://w3id.org/simpathic/fdp		11-07-2023, 13:23:57	05-06-2024, 13:23:57	ACTIVE
https://ejp-rd-fdp.ega-archive.org		02-03-2024, 11:53:09	05-06-2024, 12:53:06	ACTIVE
https://fair.ciroco.org		25-07-2023, 13:03:00	04-06-2024, 13:20:52	ACTIVE
https://w3id.org/fairvasc-fdp/		15-03-2023, 16:14:48	04-06-2024, 12:49:36	ACTIVE
https://w3id.org/duchenne-fdp		25-02-2023, 15:41:17	04-06-2024, 08:43:16	ACTIVE
https://fdp.wikipathways.org/index.ttl		27-02-2024, 22:34:01	04-06-2024, 03:02:14	ACTIVE





# Result: a federated network of FDPs representing all biobanks and patient registries

<b>EUROPEAN</b> JOINT PROGRAMME	FAIR Data Point Metadata for machines			<b>Q</b> Search FAIR	Data Point	Log in
FAIR Data Poi	nts					
Filter:		All 26 Activ	e 13 Inactive 5	Unreachable 1	Invalid 7	Unknown o
2.2.2					. 122	

It is now possible for a computational agent to automatically explore the **metadata** of all participants to discover which ones potentially contain data of interest to a rare disease researcher or clinician

hepsil Astarol S. Sunbacher ab	1 07 2020, 1012007	00 00 E0E 17 101E0107	
https://ejp-rd-fdp.ega-archive.org	02-03-2024, 11:53:09	05-06-2024, 12:53:06	ACTIVE
https://fair.ciroco.org	25-07-2023, 13:03:00	04-06-2024, 13:20:52	ACTIVE
https://w3id.org/fairvasc-fdp/	15-03-2023, 16:14:48	04-06-2024, 12:49:36	ACTIVE
https://w3id.org/duchenne-fdp	25-02-2023, 15:41:17	04-06-2024, 08:43:16	ACTIVE
https://fdp.wikipathways.org/index.ttl	27-02-2024, 22:34:01	04-06-2024, 03:02:14	ACTIVE







## Metadata Metadata Metadata!

Am I suggesting that there's no point in making FAIR data?

No...

but there's little point in working on FAIR data until you get the discovery metadata right!

Some data will never be made FAIR!





# FAIR Data

However...

EJP-RD also created FAIR Data

via an end-user-friendly <u>reusable</u> FAIRification pipeline





## Challenge

Need to make all data-focused network partner's (~50) resources work together

Partners have similar data (patient registry or biobank samples)

Partners have different starting formats

#### Generally, they are forbidden from sharing or moving their data

So the participants are going to have to do the FAIR transformation themselves, on-site, sometimes without even letting the FAIR experts see it!





Semantic Model

#### Step 2: Build a shared FAIR data model





Dr. Michel Dumontier, UMaastricht, SemanticScience Integrated Ontology



Pablo Alarcón, **Clinical and Registry Entries Semantic** Model (CARE-SM)



#### Step 3: Use CSV as a "lingua franca" for all partners

#### CSV Generated by the participants (easy!)



Legend





## Does this work, in practice?

URO-NMD is a European reference network for euromuscular diseases (NMDs), a b najor cause of mortality and lifelong (	the thematic grouping of ran	e Metadata Issued Q See	Meradata Modified	
Catalogs URD-NMD Registry Catalog URD-NMD Regi	Dear Tarliers (Dear Science and Control of Control	Analyses And and the context of the	anar Benarina sandhat Q. Sanch FAR Data Punt	AL) 8 cc
COST 00000     COST 0000	Catalogs Top-level Catalog A catalog of all data:	EAIR DA Metadata for P	Metadata houd Metadata Madifi ata Point Q. Search /W FAIR Data Point	R Data Point, Log in Advanced

#### Five FAIR Data Points for partners representing NMDs









## "What is the delay between symptom onset and diagnosis?"

 Metadata allowed automated agent to discover and interact with participants capable of providing question-relevant data
 The same query sent to all participants (shared model)
 Integrate the output





## Caveat emptor!!

# FAIR Data alone is NOT sufficient to achieve interoperability!





## This paper compares two independent FAIRification efforts over <u>identical data items</u>



Alarcón-Moreno P, et al. Leveraging Biolink as a FAIR "Rosetta Stone" Between Clinical Semantic Models Provides Emergent Interoperability. *Journal of the Society for Clinical Data Management*. 2022; 2(3): 2, pp. 1–8. DOI: https://doi.org/10.47912/jscdm.130

**ORIGINAL RESEARCH** 



Leveraging Biolink as a FAIR "Rosetta Stone" Between Clinical Semantic Models Provides Emergent Interoperability

Pablo Alarcón-Moreno<sup>\*</sup>, Ian Braun<sup>†</sup>, Emily Hartley<sup>†</sup>, Daniel Olson<sup>†</sup>, Nirupama Benis<sup>‡</sup>, Ronald Cornet<sup>‡</sup>, Mark D. Wilkinson<sup>\*</sup> and Ramona L. Walls<sup>†</sup>



Interoperability was almost zero! Shared models are necessary





# Segue into the panel session coming up next





## **FLAIR-GG**

# FAIRification, Linking And Integrated Reuse of Global *ex situ* plant Germplasm resources

Dr. Santiago Moreno Vasquez Dr. Mark D. Wilkinson Oussama Mohammed Benhamed, PhD Candidate Alberto Camara Ballesteros, PhD Candidate







One of the most complete collections of wild crucifers in the world (1,027 taxa with 4,863 accessions); Seeds of Iberian and Macaronesian endemic species; currently preserves 24% of the threatened flora in Spain



The EURISCO Web catalogue automatically receives data from the European National Inventories (NI). It provides information at the accession level of PGR conserved in European genebanks or other collections. EURISCO is hosted at and maintained by IPK Gatersleben on behalf of the Secretariat. Click here for further information and access.







- **Genesys** (global portal to information about Plant Genetic Resources for FA)
- GLIS (Global Information System for PGRFA)



Breeders Scientists Producers Taxonomists Archaeologists Etc.





National focal points (European National Inventories)



National Genebanks Networks (Crops conserved *ex-situ*)















**FLAIR-GG Objectives** 



Replicate EJP-RDs success with BGV as our first target

...then expand!





## **FLAIR-GG Status**

#### **FAIR Data Point:**

- Customized to the Germplasm case
- Automated installer available
- Metadata capture templates available
- We offer to host the FDP for any new network partner to reduce cost-of-entry



## **FLAIR-GG Status**

#### **Models and Templates**

- Shared data models have been created
- CSV Templates are completed
- Transformation pipeline tests confirm success
- FLAIR-GG infrastructure can be replicated by any partner within minutes.



## **FLAIR-GG Status**

FAIR Data Point Metadata for machines		<b>Q</b> Search FAIR Data Point	. Log in Advanced
FAIR Data Point	S		
Filter:	All 1 Active 1 Inactive 0	Unreachable • Invalid •	Unknown o
Endpoint 🔺 🔻	Registration 🔺 🔻	Modification 🔺 🔻	Status
https://w3id.org/bgv-fdp	24-07-2023, 14:04:50	06-06-2024, 14:27:21	ACTIVE

#### FAIR Data Point Federated Partner Index:

- So far... we're quite lonely!
- Several seedbank\* partners identified who should be onboard within a few weeks
- Everyone is welcome to participate!! Contact me!



ELAIR-GG Connecting Germplasm Resources	
/irtual Platform Resources: All Resources	Keyword Search:
E Catalogs (1) Datasets (3) E Distributions (0)	Submit
♣ Services (4) ⑦ Other (0)	Ontology URI:
SOURCE: http://www.bancodegermoplasma.upm.es  Resource: BGV Germplasm SPARQL Endpoint  Resource: Administrative SPARQL Endpoint	Data Services: Please select a service type from the menu below SPARQL > submit
Resource: <u>SPARQL Endpoint for Location data of BGV</u> Resource: <u>BGV FAIR Data Point Metadata SPARQL server</u>	Display Wordcloud

#### © 2023/2024 Mark D Wilkinson

Proyecto TED2021-130788B-I00 financiado por MCIN/AEI /10.13039/501100011033 y por la Unión Europea NextGenerationEU/ PRTR



## **FLAIR-GG Status**

#### **FLAIR-GG "Virtual Platform"**

- Entrypoint for federated exploration of the partner network
- Drives traffic to partner websites (!!)
- One-click launching of question-specific analytics environments such as map-integration (possible because of FAIR annotations of data services)



**FLAIR-GG Next Steps** 

# Begin constructing **shared queries** to help build data-driven conservation strategies





## **FLAIR-GG Next Steps**

Dynamic integration of partner seedbank collection records with **GBIF** species observations

#### **Conservation Strategy - Breadth:**

*"What geographic locations have not been sampled by any collection expeditions from our network partners?"* 





## **FLAIR-GG Next Steps**

Environment drives intra-species diversity - add resources such as AEMET (Spanish Meteorological Agency), IGME (Geological and Mining Institute), CNIG (Spanish Geographical Agency) to capture environmental information associated to territories where the species lives.

#### **Conservation Strategy - Depth:**

"Are there occurrence locations of species X that are within soil types or microclimates for which we lack samples in our germplasm banks?"





## **Take Home Messages**

FAIR is metadata first!!!!

FAIR is measurable, but we need global governance of testing before agencies can trust FAIR quality assessments

FAIR Data does not, alone, lead to interoperability - shared models required!

Rich, high-quality metadata enhances the appropriate reuse of FAIR data

Technologies/strategies allow FAIR experts to assist data owners in creating FAIR data themselves  $\rightarrow$  distribute the effort, rather than centralize/warehouse



Don't reinvent wheels - projects like EJP-RD and FLAIR-GG have generated a mountain of reusable code and models for FAIRification

www.chen unm es



## Acknowledgements

#### https://tinvurl.com/UNBigData2024



My numerous and treasured collaborators and co-authors have been cited in situ throughout this slide deck









WORLD

DUCHENNE

ORGANIZATION

SIC

TED2021-130788B-I00





Plan de Recuperación. Transformación Resiliencia



European Union's Horizon Europe fgrant agreement No. 101130187

STroils